

00001

1

2

3

4

5

6

YUKON-KUSKOKWIM DELTA FEDERAL  
SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

8

9

VOLUME I

10

11

March 2, 1999

12

13

Alakanuk City Hall, Alakanuk, Alaska

14

15 Members Present:

16

17 Mr. Harry O. Wilde, Sr., Chairman

18 Mr. Fritz L. George, Secretary

19 Mr. Ilarion J. Nicolai

20 Mr. Willard Church

21 Mr. James Charles

22 Mr. Billy McCann

23 Mr. Johnny B. Thompson

24 Mr. Lester Wilde

25 Mr. John Hanson, Sr., Alternate member

26

27 Mr. John Andrew, Coordinator

00002

P R O C E E D I N G S

(On record - 8:33 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I call to order.

Invocation. (In Yup'ik)

INTERPRETER NICK: During the invocation we would like to remember Billy McCann.

UNIDENTIFIED: Let us pray. In the name of the Father and of the Son and Holy Spirit. Great Spirit you are the force of all in the universe, you are the force of all here on earth. You have given us all that we have and all that we are. You have given to us the land for us to use. You have given us the animals on the land, the birds in the air, the fish in the waters and the seas. You have given all of these to us for us to use so that we will live in happiness and peace with you, with the land and with each other.

We thank you for all that you have given us and we thank you for making it possible to be together today that this meeting. We welcome all who are here to attend this gathering. We welcome those from the other government, the State and Federal governments so that we can talk and get to know what it is that you want us to do.

Great Spirit, you are the source of all wisdom, we ask that you send us your wisdom in this gathering. Place your wisdom in our hearts and in our minds so that we will begin to take care of ourselves and our land and our animals, our birds and our fish in a better way. We pray, Lord, for all that you have given us, especially those who are in need of your help or those who are not feeling well, for those who have been sick. We pray, especially now, for Mr. McCann that you will bring him back to good health so that he will be a source of help to his family, to his community, to our country, to our nation.

And we thank you, Lord, for making it possible for this group to be together so that we will begin to share the wealth of your generosity. We pray in your most holy name. Amen.

CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I'll ask secretary George for a roll call.

MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

00003

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

2

3 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion Nicolai.

4

5 MR. NICOLAI: Here.

6

7 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

8

9 MR. McCANN: Here.

10

11 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

12

13 MR. J. ANDREW: Absent. Excused.

14

15 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson, Sr.

16

17 MR. HANSON: Here.

18

19 MR. GEORGE: James Charlie [sic].

20

21 MR. CHARLES: Here.

22

23 MR. GEORGE: Robert Nick.

24

25 MR. J. ANDREW: Excused.

26

27 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

28

29 MR. L. WILDE: Here.

30

31 MR. GEORGE: Thadius Tikiun.

32

33 (No audible response)

34

35 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

36

37 MR. J. ANDREW: Excused.

38

39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Paul Manumik will be here

40 sometime today after funeral, so excused.

41

42 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

43

44 MR. CHURCH: Here.

45

46 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson.

47

48 MR. THOMPSON: Here.

49

50 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine here with

00004

1 three excused, quorum established.

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. Thank you, George.

4 We have a quorum.

5

6 I would like to welcome Regional Advisory Council to  
7 Alakanuk. This Council is Yukon-Kuskokwim Federal  
8 Subsistence Regional Council. I'd like to welcome each one  
9 of those and where they're from. Paul John he couldn't be  
10 here because he went -- supposed to go up north, up to  
11 Kotzebue looking what Eskimo medicine up there in their  
12 hospital, how they use it. So this morning -- Paul John is  
13 Vice Chairman of Kodiak Region, he couldn't be here. And  
14 Fritz George is right here next to me, member Council,  
15 Secretary from Akiachak. And Paul Manumik, Sr. he couldn't  
16 be here, they're having a funeral down in -- today is  
17 supposed to be a funeral, I think, down in Sheldon Point.  
18 Robert Nick, Sr. from Nunapitchuk, Alaska, he couldn't be  
19 here due to family -- Ilarion Nicolai, Council member from  
20 Kwethluk, Alaska. Willard Church, Council member from  
21 Quinhagak. Billy McCann, Council member, Bethel, Alaska.  
22 Johnny Thompson, Sr., Council member St. Mary's. Lester  
23 Wilde, Council member, Hooper Bay, Alaska. John Hanson,  
24 Council member alternate, Alakanuk, Alaska. Thadius Tikiun,  
25 Council member alternate, Bethel, Alaska. He's not here  
26 today.

27

28 Also, I would like to introduce John Andrew, Yukon-  
29 Kuskokwim Advisory Coordinator, he's next to me here. And  
30 also in this meeting I would like to introduce the very well  
31 know, in Yukon and Kuskokwin, working for Federal Yukon Delta  
32 National Wildlife Refuge, Chuck Hunt and Alex Nick, they're  
33 our interpreters for this meeting.

34

35 MR. L. WILDE: You forgot James.

36

37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik) James  
38 Charlie, Council member, Tuntutuliak. Quyana.

39

40 And I would like to ask John Andrew to introduce our  
41 guests and staff, State and Federal.

42

43 MR. J. ANDREW: From our regional office in  
44 Anchorage we have Sue Detwiler and right next to her is Mike  
45 Coffing, with the State Subsistence Division, Bristol Bay  
46 Council member, Pete Abraham. Then we got AVCP, Andrew over  
47 there, my other cousin over there. And then from the local I  
48 see Bob Philip (In Yup'ik) John James.

49

50 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Quyana, John.

00005

1 MR. J. ANDREW: And Court Reporter, I forgot.  
2 Then we have our Court Recorder over there Joe Kolasinski.

3  
4 REPORTER: Kolasinski.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you.

7  
8 MS. DETWILER: I'm Sue Detwiler from the Fish  
9 and Wildlife Service, Officer of Subsistence Management. The  
10 biologist and the anthropologist, Pat McClenahan and Dave  
11 Fisher, both have some illness and so they weren't able to  
12 make it out to this meeting, but we're going to try to hook  
13 them up by teleconference this morning, so that they can give  
14 you the information that they have.

15  
16 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. Thank you. Number  
17 5, review and adoption of agenda. Add new items under D.  
18 Council members you could find it under Tab B. Six, review  
19 adoption of minutes of public meeting held October 6 and 7,  
20 1998. You can find this under Tab C. Seven, public  
21 testimonies. Please note, this opportunity continues  
22 throughout the meeting, please fill out a testifier's form at  
23 the sign-in table.

24  
25 Eight, Old Business.

26  
27 A. Wanton waste issue update (YDNWR/AVCP), you can  
28 find this on Tab D.

29  
30 B. Update Federal subsistence fisheries management  
31 (staff), you'll find this under Tab E.

32  
33 C. Update on the results of the village meetings on  
34 migratory bird management (staff). You'll find this under Tab  
35 F.

36  
37 D. Update on Cooperative Agreements (Pat McClenahan).  
38 She's supposed to be here, but she's not here.

39  
40 E. Update on C&T Working Group recommendations (Pat  
41 McClenahan). Someone will take this -- you find it on Tab G.

42  
43 F. 1998 Annual Report - update, addition of any other  
44 issues, approval (John Andrew).

45  
46 Nine. New Business.

47  
48 A. Proposals to change Federal subsistence  
49 regulations on taking of wildlife on Federal public lands.  
50 Tab H you find that.

00006

1 Presentation procedure for each proposal.

2

- 3 1. Introduction of proposals/analysis (lead).
- 4 2. Alaska Department of Fish and Game comments.
- 5 3. Other agency comments/Easter Interior
- 6 Regional Council recommendation on overlap
- 7 proposals.
- 8 4. summary of written public comments (Andrew)
- 9 5. Public testimony.
- 10 6. Regional Council deliberation and
- 11 recommendation and justification.
- 12

13 The following stand-alone proposals affects only the  
14 Yukon-Kuskokwim Region.

15

16 Proposal 99-41: Regulatory proposal for beavers in  
17 Unit 18 to change the season and bag  
18 limits (Dave Fisher)

19

20 The following proposals overlap with the Western  
21 Interior Region:

22

23 Proposal 99-42: C&T for moose in 19(B) for residents  
24 of Quinhagak and rural residents of  
25 Unit 18. (Pat McClenahan)

26

27 Proposal 99-43: Black bear: Establish C&T to include  
28 residents of Unit 21 and 23, Tanana,  
29 Russian Mission, and others. (Pat  
30 McClenahan)

31

32 Proposal 99-45: Shorten the moose season in Unit  
33 21(E). (Dave Fisher)

34

35 The following proposal originate in Bristol Bay  
36 Region and affect residents in the Yukon-Kuskokwim Region:

37

38 Proposal 99-37: Revise C&T for caribou in Unit 17 to  
39 include residents of Unit 18 (Pat  
40 McClenahan)

41

42 Proposal 99-38: Revise C&T for caribou in 17(A) for  
43 residents of Eek and Quinhagak. (Pat  
44 McClenahan)

45

46 Proposal 99-40: Request establishing a season for  
47 moose in 17(A). Deferred proposal  
48 (P98-59), submitted by Togiak  
49 National Wildlife Refuge. (Dave  
50 Fisher)

00007

1 B. Regional Council application process (Andrew).  
2 You would find this in your Tab I.

3  
4 C. Agency reports:

5  
6 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Office of  
7 Subsistence Management.

8  
9 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Yukon Delta  
10 National Wildlife Refuge. (Mike Reardon)

11  
12 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Togiak  
13 National Wildlife Refuge.  
14 (Archibeque/Aderman)

15  
16 Bureau of Land Management. (Jeff Denton)

17  
18 Association of Village Council Presidents,  
19 Inc. (Tim Andrew) Myron is not here, just  
20 Tim Andrew.

21  
22 State of Alaska:

23  
24 Subsistence Division - Mike Coffing  
25 Division of Boards - Ida is not here.  
26 How about Wildlife Conservation -  
27 Roger Seavoy  
28 Commercial Fisheries is supposed Dan  
29 Bergstrom  
30 And also Sport Fishing, John Burr. I  
31 think Mike Coffing is going to do all the work today.

32  
33 If there's any other new business that we're prepared  
34 to put it on new business. Any discussion of any new  
35 business, it should be put on the agenda. If it's not we're  
36 on:

37  
38 10. Benediction.

39  
40 11. Time and place of next public meeting. You'll  
41 find that in Tab J

42  
43 12. Adjournment.

44  
45 Again, we would thank Chuck and Alex Nick for  
46 interpreting today. Thank you

47  
48 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to move  
49 that we adopt the agenda as is.

50

00008

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion on the  
2 floor by Lester to adopt the agenda as read. Is there a  
3 second.

4  
5 MR. CHARLES: Second the motion.

6  
7 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second, Charles.  
8 Discussion?

9  
10 MR. L. WILDE: Question.

11  
12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question has been called  
13 for, all in favor say aye.

14  
15 IN UNISON: Aye.

16  
17 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Opposed say no.

18  
19 (No opposing responses)

20  
21 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Motion carried. (In  
22 Yup'ik)

23  
24 MR. GEORGE: October 6th and 7th, 1998. (In  
25 Yup'ik)

26  
27 INTERPRETER NICK: Yukon-Kuskokwim  
28 Subsistence Regional Advisory, Bethel, Alaska Cultural  
29 Center, October 6th and 7th, 1998 minutes. Members present,  
30 Harry, Wilde, Sr., Iliarion Nicolai, Billy McCann, James  
31 Charles, Lester Wilde, John Hanson, Thadius Tikiun, Robert  
32 Nick and Willard Church.

33  
34 And excused were Johnny B. Thompson from Saint  
35 Mary's, Paul John, Vice Chair, Toksook Bay, Fritz George,  
36 Secretary, Akiachuak. Absent were Paul Manumik, Sr., Sheldon  
37 Point.

38  
39 Federal and State Agencies here:

40  
41 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Office of Subsistence  
42 Management: Taylor Brelsford, Pat McClenahan, Dave Fisher,  
43 Terry Wild, John Andrew. Yukon Delta/Togiak National Wildlife  
44 Refuge: Mike Reardon, Steve Kovach, Chuck Hunt, Paul  
45 Liedberg, Alex Nick, Aaron Archibekue, Andy Aderman, John  
46 Dyasuk. Alaska Department of Fish and Game: Mike Coffing,  
47 Ida Alexie, Roger Seavoy, Charlie Burkey, Rich Cannon, Leo  
48 Kelly, Jim Menard.

49  
50 Translators were Jon Dyasuk, Chuck Hunt, Alex Nick.



00009

1 Court recorder: Meredith Downing.

2  
3 Call to Order:

4  
5 The meeting was called to order by Chairman Wilde at  
6 8:20 a.m. in the Cultural Center in Bethel.

7  
8 Roll Call and Announcement of Quorum:

9  
10 Roll call was doe by member Ilarion, and the quorum  
11 was established.

12  
13 Under Introductions:

14  
15 Introductions were made: Council members,  
16 Subsistence Management Staff, Togiak & Yukon Delta National  
17 Wildlife Refuge Staff, State Department Staff, and AVCP Inc.  
18 and N.R. Specialist.

19  
20 Under Review and Approval of Agenda:

21  
22 The Regional Council reviewed the agenda. A motion  
23 was made by Robert Nick to approve the agenda and it was  
24 seconded by James Charles. The motion passed by unanimous  
25 vote.

26  
27 Under the Review and Adoption of Minutes of  
28 March 3 and 4, 1998:

29  
30 The minutes of March 3 and 4, 1998 were summarized in  
31 Yup'ik by Coordinator Andrew. James Charles moved to approve  
32 the corrected minutes, and was seconded by Robert Nick.  
33 Question called for and motion carried.

34  
35 Under Election of Officers:

36  
37 Harry Wilde, Sr. was nominated by John Hanson and was  
38 seconded by Robert Nick. Robert moved to close nominations,  
39 seconded by John Hanson. Question was called for. Vote:  
40 all ayes, no opposition. Ilarion Nicolai moved to retain  
41 rest of the officers for another year and was seconded by  
42 Lester Wilde. Question was called for. Motion carried.

43  
44 9:00 to 9:10 were break.

45  
46 Right after the break Chairman Wilde  
47 appointed Billy McCann as interim Sergeant-at-arms.

48  
49 Open Floor to Public Comments on the Federal  
50 Subsistence Management Program:

00010

1           The Chairman opened the floor to resource concerns.  
2 Member Lester Wilde opened the comments addressing the bottom  
3 fish/shellfish die-off washing ashore in their area. There  
4 was a mention of alarming quantities of seabird die-off  
5 washing ashore in Nunivak and the coastal areas since 1997.

6  
7           At this time, the Chair recognized the Refuge  
8 Manager, Michael Reardon to address the potential explosive  
9 issue of wanton waste. He started off by recounting the  
10 times over the years that he had worked with the different  
11 Council members and that he is confident that the make up of  
12 the current Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory Council members  
13 are intelligent and capable of handling resource problems  
14 wisely. He handled this very sensitive issue very well and  
15 his presentation was right to the point and eloquently  
16 delivered without getting it out of hand. Mr. Reardon had  
17 pictures of wanton waste samples.

18  
19           Some of the "wanton waste" issue brought out were: A  
20 hunter shoots five caribou near the airport and leaves them  
21 all and then shoots another three on the airport which he  
22 salvaged.

23  
24           A hunter shoots a moose out of season and leaves the  
25 neck and backbone to rot and the rest rotted in his cache and  
26 did not share the meat.

27  
28           In 1998, eight brown bears were shot and left to rot  
29 in the Goodnews Bay River [sic].

30  
31           A hunter confesses to killing several cow moose and  
32 leaving one to rot here it lays, and the killing of a brown  
33 bear on the way home and only taking the gall bladder and the  
34 claws.

35  
36           Several young men shot a cow and a calf and left them  
37 to rot.

38  
39           Ever since the Mulchatna Caribou Herd has been  
40 migrating through our area there has been a numerous cases of  
41 wanton waste where hunters have only taken the choicest parts  
42 and leaving the rest in the field. One of worst cases was  
43 where a young hunter from this area with several other young  
44 men slaughtered several dozen and then taking only the hind  
45 quarters and the choice parts, leaving the rest of the  
46 carcasses for the foxes and the ravens.

47  
48           In 1998, Fish and Wildlife Service employee discovers  
49 (pictures taken) a large pile of pike fish rotting in a  
50 dumpster.

00011

1           Recent years, seals rotting on the coastal village  
2 banks or shores, in one case there were nine seals. Beluga  
3 whales with only the "mungtag" salvaged and the meat left to  
4 rot. Another time hunters from a nearby village shot eight  
5 musk-ox at Queek River. After discussion among the members  
6 and staff members of different agencies, Council member  
7 Lester Wilde moved for Fish and Wildlife Service to implement  
8 a public awareness education program to educate the public of  
9 illegal wanton waste. This motion was seconded by Robert  
10 Nick. Question was called for, and the motion carried.

11  
12           There was a discussion for the State of Alaska to  
13 recognize the problem, support and do or create a Memorandum  
14 of Agreement to do enforcement work in this area. School  
15 program on the wanton waste issue is to be worked out with  
16 LKSD member Robert Nick, Fish and Wildlife Service, AVCP,  
17 Inc., and State of Alaska.

18  
19           At this time, the Chair asked the Togiak National  
20 Wildlife Refuge staff to introduce themselves, Refuge  
21 Manager, Aaron Archibeque; Biologist, Andy Aderman; and  
22 Interpreter Jon Dyasuk.

23  
24           Other issues brought forth were the hovercraft issue,  
25 too many beavers, beaver dams stopping fish migrations.

26  
27                     Open Floor to Proposals to Change Federal  
28 Regulations:

29  
30           The Chairman opened the floor to proposals from the  
31 public, agencies, and the Council members. There was one  
32 proposal from Ted Hamilton from Emmonak on beavers. They  
33 wanted to be able to trap them year around and be able to  
34 shoot (hunt) them at the same time. The language needed  
35 cleaning up and to be rewritten to be more acceptable. After  
36 discussions, the Chair requested staff to help them rewrite  
37 the language and table it for future considerations.

38  
39                     Old Business:

40  
41           Update on Federal Subsistence Fisheries  
42 Implementation Program was presented by Taylor Brelsford.  
43 Public hearings were done in Bethel on March 2, 1998 where 20  
44 people testified and in St. Mary's on March 10, 1998.

45  
46           Pre-statehood, Federal lands include waters  
47 surrounding Federal lands. Subsistence caught foods are  
48 permitted for bartering in any way, shape or form, but not  
49 for money.

50

00012

1 Lunch break 11:15 to 1:30 p.m.

2

3 (Continuation) The publication of the Final Rule will  
4 be in January of 1999. Budge for FY99 is 9.5 million, and  
5 for FY2000 it at 18 million. There will be 70 new positions  
6 and half of them will be biologist positions. There will be  
7 cooperative efforts to work with the Alaska Department of  
8 Fish and Game (in-season management program). There were  
9 discussions of possible subcontract work with the cooperating  
10 partners.

11

12 The 1997 Annual Report reply was delivered in Yup'ik  
13 by Coordinator Andrew. Under Discussions Billy McCann  
14 brought out his concerns on how much of the salmon are  
15 intercepted in the high seas and Area M. His other concerns  
16 was that the possibility of the bull moose being  
17 overharvested to the point that they are hurting the breeding  
18 stock.

19

20 Biologist Steve Kovach responded by say that for  
21 every 100 cows, 15 bulls are adequate to support next year's  
22 calves.

23

24 Mr. Hanson brought up the subject of old cows with  
25 long bells.

26

27 Robert Nick of Nunapitchuk brought out the  
28 cooperative efforts amount the three tundra villages is not  
29 working out. They are squabbling over the resource and one  
30 of the villages tend to overharvest.

31

32 Thadius Tikiun brought up that hunting season for  
33 Unit 18 is longer than that of Unit 19. He suggested that it  
34 needs to be shortened up and stressed the need for  
35 enforcement of poachers.

36

37 Robert Nick inquired on the impact of forest fires on  
38 the migration of the moose. Steve Kovach replied that the  
39 forest fires are usually small in our area and do not make  
40 much of an impact.

41

42 Roger Seavoy replied that part of the increase in the  
43 moose populations is due to the efforts of those who are  
44 working on conservation.

45

46 There was a break between 3:05 and 3:15.

47

48 The meeting was called back to order by Chairman  
49 Wilde. The Chair recognized Pat McClenahan to provide and  
50 update on the C&T Taskforce Report. The Council listened to

00013

1 the presentation of Pat McClenahan and pondered on the  
2 options of C&T choices. Alternate member John Hanson moved  
3 to make no changes to the C&T process, and was seconded by  
4 Billy McCann. Question was called for and the Chair  
5 requested for a roll call vote. Votes were nine yeas, three  
6 excused and one absent.

7

8 Alternate/Secretarial Action on the Y-K  
9 Regional Council Charter:

10

11 Secretaries of Interior and Agriculture established  
12 alternate as part of the membership section of the charters  
13 for Kodiak/Aleutian Islands, Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta, Seward  
14 Peninsula and North Slope. And alternate serves only when a  
15 regular member cannot attend a meeting. Alternates are  
16 authorized to attend an orientation session and one meeting  
17 per year. Alternates are entitled to the same travel and per  
18 diem before [sic] as a Regional Council member. The addition  
19 of alternate seats to four of the 1998 Regional Council  
20 charters received Secretarial approval.

21

22 Board Action/805 Letter Report

23

24 Pat McClenahan and Dave Fisher covered this report  
25 group into five groups.

26

27 1. Yukon-Kuskokwim Proposals 62 and 63.

28

29 2. RFR 97-12 caribou Unit 22(A) for Chevak,  
30 Hooper Bay and Scammon Bay.

31

32 3. Proposals 64, 65, 66, and 67.

33

34 4. Proposals 69, 70, 71, 72, (73-75  
35 dropped).

36

37 5. Proposals 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 58, 59, and

38 60.

39

40 How are the Animal Populations Doing?

41

42 Steve Kovach reported caribou population increasing  
43 with the influx of Mulchatna caribou expanding their  
44 migratory range into Unit 18. ADF&G and U.S. Fish and  
45 Wildlife Service hope to get 30 collared by next month to  
46 better monitor or study the caribou.

46

47 Moose: Provided a graph to the Council and staff and  
48 audience on the potential growth from one cow and her  
49 offspring.

50

00014

1 Black Bears: No harvest report required.

2

3 Brown Bears: No new report, but collaring projected  
4 to be reported later.

5

6 Wolf/Wolverines: Increased numbers of wolves and  
7 wolverine. Refuge to work with ADF&G on study if funds are  
8 made available.

9

10 Under New Business Reports:

11

12 Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge:

13

14 A. Chuck Hunt gave an update on the Steel Shot  
15 Program going on its 10th successful year.

16

17 B. Mike Reardon: Emperors are still low in  
18 numbers, but other three species are stable  
19 and increasing. Emperor geese count about  
20 39,000. This may be due to overharvesting of  
21 the species by some communities that are not  
22 on the Goose Management Plan.

23

24 C. Brown Bear Collaring Project update.

25

26 D. Migratory Bird Treaty Act: Meetings are  
27 scheduled for this winter to establish  
28 managing bodies and to propose seasons and  
29 bag limits for certain species of migratory  
30 birds.

31

32 Togiak National Wildlife Refuge: In the interest of  
33 saving time, Andy Aderman skipped over walrus, seabirds and  
34 Public Use Management Plan. He provided written reports  
35 covering those subjects including caribou and moose.

36

37 Oral report: Last winter there were over 30 to 40  
38 caribou in the Togiak drainage. In the early years there  
39 used to be only 20 to 25 moose in the same area and today  
40 their latest count showed 429. Possible factors for the  
41 rapid increase in moose may be due to, one, good habitat,  
42 two, mild winters, three, not much hunters out there, and,  
43 four, availability of caribou in their area.

44

45 Bureau of Land Management did not make it to  
46 the meeting.

47

48 Recess at 5:15 p.m.

49

50 On 10/7/98 - Meeting was called back to order

00015

1 at 8:20 a.m.

2

3

4 Association of Council Presidents, Inc.,  
5 Natural resources specialist, Michelle Sparcks reported on  
6 the activities of the Association of Village Council  
7 Presidents Natural Resource Department. Some of the issues  
8 she covered were fishery disaster work, marine mammals,  
9 sliding chum cap, working with Board of Fisheries, rod and  
10 reel issue for subsistence users, sportsmen's activities,  
11 wanton waste, Anti-Wolf Snaring Initiative, Native Migratory  
12 Working Group migratory birds, Goose Management Plan, Izembek  
13 Road issue (WCC concern), and the Federal fisheries  
14 moratorium.

15

16 Chairman Wilde thanked the Council and the  
17 staff for being flexible making this meeting happen. He  
18 thanked the Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge staff for  
19 their hospitality in putting up the Council members in the  
20 bunk house, meeting place and providing for their  
21 transportation. Acknowledged the efforts of the Togiak  
22 National Wildlife Refuge staff to make it to this meeting.  
23 Appreciation and thanks extended to the translators, Chuck  
24 Hunt, Alex Nick and Jon Dyasuk. Gratitude was also extended  
25 to the following: Mike Coffing, Ida Alexie, Roger Seavoy  
26 Charlie Burkey, Rich Cannon, Michelle Sparcks. Qu yana to all  
27 involved for your patience.

28

29 Time and Place of Next Meeting.

30

31 Coordinator Andrew explained the winter meeting  
32 schedule window opening and which Regional Advisory Council  
33 meetings to avoid. Lester Wilde moved the next meeting to  
34 take place in Alakanuk on March 2 and 3, 1999 and seconded by  
35 John Hanson. There was a discussion on the alternate meeting  
36 site in case the weather gets unfavorable. The motion was  
37 amended to have Emmonak as an alternate meeting site.  
38 Question was called for and the motion carried by voice vote.

39

40 Benediction: The closing prayer was  
41 delivered by Billy McCann of Bethel.

42

43 Adjournment: Lester Wilde moved to adjourn  
44 the meeting, seconded by Billy McCann. Motion passed  
45 unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

46

47 Prepared and respectfully submitted.

48

49 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Qu yana, Secretary George.

50 (In Yup'ik)

00016

1 INTERPRETER NICK: Chairman Lester [sic]  
2 Wilde asked how the minutes looked like to the Council  
3 members, are there any corrections necessary?  
4

5 MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman.  
6

7 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.  
8

9 MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman, John Andrew.  
10 (In Yup'ik)  
11

12 INTERPRETER NICK: John Andrew said that Mike  
13 Coffing gave him a note that during that meeting he reported  
14 from Subsistence Division. Roger Seavoy gave a report on  
15 behalf of Wildlife Conservation. Charlie Burkey from  
16 Commercial Fisheries, Ida Alexie from Division of Boards.  
17 They submitted their reports respectfully at the time.  
18

19 MR. ABRAHAM: Mr. Chairman.  
20

21 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah.  
22

23 MR. ABRAHAM: Mr. Chairman, Pete Abraham,  
24 Bristol Bay Council (In Yup'ik).  
25

26 INTERPRETER NICK: These are my respective  
27 comments. I'd like -- in Bristol Bay they were discussing  
28 similar issues. I'd like to put my support. I wanted to ask  
29 what happened after the reports were given? What has been  
30 done after that on the education of -- there's been some  
31 opposition to subsistence activities in Alaska. There's been  
32 a lot of opposition to some of our subsistence activities and  
33 there's some problems that occur from that and we'd like to  
34 get that resolved. It says there will be information and  
35 education on wanton waste in the schools and some of the --  
36 this subject was recommended by Robert Nick.  
37

38 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)  
39

40 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik) I can't hear him from  
41 here.  
42

43 INTERPRETER NICK: The Chairman asked Chuck  
44 Hunt to explain that.  
45

46 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Yup'ik)  
47

48 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)  
49

50 INTERPRETER NICK: Peter -- Chuck said that



00017

1 he couldn't hear him from here and Pete Abraham from Togiak  
2 wanted to make a suggestion He said that he would like to  
3 recommend something that they might be able to use. U.S.  
4 Fish and Wildlife Service staff have some funds to travel.  
5 State of Alaska's funding is limited. These information and  
6 education could be delivered to the villages and the schools  
7 and also probably, with the assistance of the elders, and  
8 maybe through news media and also through television.

9  
10 Because there's some information and education. I'd  
11 like to make recommendation because it might help with  
12 planning the information/education. In Togiak area there was  
13 some incidents regarding wanton waste on brown bear. They  
14 left the bear after they harvested out in the field.

15  
16 Quayana.

17  
18 MR. HUNT: Mr. Chairman.

19  
20 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Chuck.

21  
22 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

23  
24 INTERPRETER NICK: Chuck Hunt stated that  
25 he's going to include that in his report.

26  
27 MR. McCANN: Mr. Chairman.

28  
29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Bill.

30  
31 MR. McCANN: (In Yup'ik)

32  
33 INTERPRETER NICK: Billy McCann says that  
34 during the time -- he said that wanton waste should be  
35 written and sent to all of the Council members and the  
36 villages. And he also mentioned this in the KYAK Yup'ik Talk  
37 Show regarding the wanton waste issue out in the field. He  
38 said that he brought this up in Yup'ik. He advised the  
39 people of the Delta that U.S. Fish and Wildlife Conservation  
40 staff and also elders have advised our people that, you know,  
41 there should not be any wanton waste of fish and wildlife.  
42 He wanted that in a written form and then submitted to  
43 villages.

44  
45 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Chuck.

46  
47 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

48  
49 INTERPRETER NICK: Chuck responded to say  
50 that that will be in his report.

00018

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. We're going to  
2 discuss this item again if we get into Annual Report.

3  
4 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Yup'ik) Quyana.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: At this time.....

7  
8 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

9  
10 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

11  
12 MR. L. WILDE: Can I ask somebody here.  
13 These minutes that we have in our packet, these are --  
14 they're not official minutes of the last meeting, the  
15 official minutes are more in length. Are these just excerpts  
16 from the last meeting that we had, John, or are these the  
17 official minutes?

18  
19 MR. J. ANDREW: Those are the minutes. Our  
20 secretaries write up, everything accurate. They do it.....

21  
22 MR. L. WILDE: These are not really the  
23 official minutes then?

24  
25 MR. J. ANDREW: And you're thinking about the  
26 transcripts. The transcripts are too lengthy.

27  
28 MR. L. WILDE: No, I'm just asking, are these  
29 the official minutes that are recorded? Are these.....

30  
31 MR. J. ANDREW: For this purpose, yes.

32  
33 MR. L. WILDE: Just for this meeting's  
34 purpose. They're just excerpts, right?

35  
36 MR. J. ANDREW: Uh-huh (affirmative).

37  
38 MR. L. WILDE: So misspelled words and misuse  
39 of language in here doesn't necessarily mean.....

40  
41 MR. J. ANDREW: After they're approved  
42 they're corrected.

43  
44 MR. L. WILDE: Oh, okay. So, I'm not going  
45 to worry about the misuse of terms or misspelled words. All  
46 right.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more corrections  
49 additional to our minutes?

50

00019

1 MR. HUNT: Mr. Chairman.

2  
3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Chuck.

4  
5 MR. HUNT: Mr. Chairman, one on page three.

6  
7 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Page three?

8  
9 MR. HUNT: The second line (In Yup'ik)  
10 discovers (picture taken) a large pile pike fish rotting in a  
11 dumpster. It's not dumpster, it's dump.

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

14  
15 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

16  
17 INTERPRETER NICK: And also on page 5 under  
18 new business, third line -- beginning from fourth line.

19  
20 MR. HUNT: This may be due to overharvesting  
21 of species (indiscernible - simultaneous translation on same  
22 channel).

23  
24 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman, I remember that  
25 discussion quite well and it was that he stated that they  
26 were not on the Goose Management Plan. I remember that  
27 statement very well. It's correct the way he stated it.

28  
29 MR. HUNT: I sit as corrected.

30  
31 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Chuck.

32  
33 MR. HUNT: Qu yana.

34  
35 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more correction  
36 additional to our minutes?

37  
38 (No audible responses)

39  
40 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If there's not we're  
41 ready for adoption of our minutes. (In Yup'ik)

42  
43 INTERPRETER NICK: Need a motion.....

44  
45 MR. CHARLES: Mr. Chairman, I move to adopt  
46 the October meetings with corrections.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: March 3 and 4.

49  
50 MR. CHARLES: October 6 and 7.

00020

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: October 6 and 7 minutes.  
2 Is there any second to the motion?

3  
4 MR. McCANN: I second it.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by Billy McCann.  
7 Discussion?

8  
9 MR. HANSON: Question.

10  
11 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question has been called  
12 for, all in favor say aye.

13  
14 IN UNISON: Aye.

15  
16 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Opposed say no.

17  
18 (No opposing responses)

19  
20 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Motion carried. The  
21 minutes are approved.

22  
23 We'll have a 10 minute break.

24  
25 (Off record - 9:39 a.m.)

26  
27 (On record - 10:01 a.m.)

28  
29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

30  
31 INTERPRETER NICK: The meeting is called back  
32 to order. And if you haven't recorded or signed in you must  
33 sign in a guests.

34  
35 Chairperson Harry Wilde is introducing the guests.  
36 He says in Yup'ik that the people who come here are  
37 conservationists the manages fish and wildlife. And that we  
38 are working toward management of subsistence resources and if  
39 people know that the is meeting is being held today there  
40 might be more people here attending the meeting and  
41 participate in the discussion of the proposals.

42  
43 Anyone who has a proposal to present to the Council,  
44 they could present it in Yup'ik or in English. There's two  
45 translators here that can translate English to Yup'ik, Yup'ik  
46 to English.

47  
48 Agenda Item Number 8. Chuck Hunt and Tim Andrew are  
49 going to report on wanton waste.

50

00021

1 MR. HUNT: Qu yana, Mr. Chairman (In Yup'ik).

2

3 INTERPRETER NICK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,  
4 my name is Chuck Hunt, I work at the Yukon Delta National  
5 Wildlife Refuge. The Regional Council, during their meeting  
6 on October 6 and 7, that wanton waste should be brought to  
7 the attention of the Yukon Delta residents through  
8 information and education.

9

10 Mike Reardon directed me, that the Refuge Information  
11 Technician, should bring the issue to villages in Yukon-  
12 Kuskokwim Delta, and include that in our information and  
13 education in villages in March. The information and  
14 education issue was included in the assignment for RIT who  
15 will bringing the issue to the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta  
16 residents through meetings and schools.

17

18 The wanton waste will be included in the INE  
19 assignment for RITs to present and develop. Mr. Reardon has  
20 brought to the attention of the Regional Council what they  
21 found out about wanton waste in Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta.

22

23 In reviewing Section D, what's present in this page  
24 is good, but the Refuge Information Technicians from Yukon  
25 Delta National Wildlife Refuge in Bethel, during the  
26 information/education meetings in the villages and also  
27 school programs, they present all issues of conservation of  
28 fish and wildlife, including migratory birds in the villages.

29

30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

31

32 INTERPRETER NICK: Excuse me. The  
33 Chairperson wants everyone to use translators, the guests  
34 that come in to wear a translator.

35

36 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

37

38 INTERPRETER NICK: And also in the grade  
39 schools and high schools, all of these issues will be  
40 presented to them. Refuge Manager has informed me that  
41 wanton waste issue may not in the news media or in television  
42 or radio. But then after we do proper planning we might be  
43 presenting this to the public by TV, radio and news media.  
44 One of the reasons why we're being careful in this issue is  
45 that some people don't take it very kindly how we present any  
46 issues in the Delta. For that reason we need to do a proper  
47 planning before we present it in the radio PSA and also in  
48 the news media.

49

50 At present time Fish and Wildlife and Fish and Game

00022

1 Enforcement personnel are working on enforcing wanton waste  
2 in the Delta. Refuge Manager, Mike Reardon, will not be able  
3 to make it to this meeting. When it comes to the agenda, I  
4 will be reporting some of the reports that will need to be  
5 presented to Council. And also Steve Kovach, who is big game  
6 biologist, will not be able to attend this meeting. When it  
7 comes to his report I will also present some the issues.

8  
9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

10  
11 INTERPRETER NICK: Are there any questions to  
12 Chuck?

13  
14 MR. CHARLES: Mr. Chairman. Chuck (In  
15 Yup'ik).

16  
17 INTERPRETER NICK: James Charles asked -- he  
18 wanted clarification on wanton waste, he wanted that  
19 interpreted into Yup'ik.

20  
21 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

22  
23 INTERPRETER NICK: He said that the  
24 definition of wanton waste is not same, but the general idea  
25 is that if a hunter harvests any big game or fish and  
26 wildlife and then leaves it out there, even if they take part  
27 of that, it will be considered as wanton waste.

28  
29 MR. NICOLAI: (In Yup'ik) Chairman.

30  
31 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Billy.

32  
33 MR. McCANN: (In Yup'ik)

34  
35 INTERPRETER NICK: Billy McCann said that  
36 he's aware that in some cases when the hunter wounds an  
37 animal it walks away or runs away from a hunter and then dies  
38 elsewhere.

39  
40 MR. HUNT: (In Yup'ik)

41  
42 INTERPRETER NICK: Chuck responded that each  
43 Native person, when they begin to hunt, they are advised that  
44 if they wound any animal or any bird they are to search for  
45 that wounded animal until they find it, but hen even though  
46 that's done, it's impossible to find the animal. There's  
47 also a rule in the State regulations that if a wounded animal  
48 or game walks away from a hunter that hunter will do all he  
49 or she can to find that animal, but then if all else then,  
50 you know, they could abandon the search.

00023

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Anyone else?

2  
3 MR. THOMPSON: (In Yup'ik)

4  
5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Johnny.

6  
7 MR. THOMPSON: (In Yup'ik)

8  
9 INTERPRETER NICK: Johnny Thompson from St.  
10 Marys said that it's good that there's something done about  
11 the wanton waste, but then any given hunter could wound any  
12 animals or game. I think that there is two things about this  
13 issue. When a person cannot find an animal, no matter what  
14 he does in searching for the animal, he cannot find the  
15 animals sometimes. Some time one respective hunter or  
16 hunters cannot harvest an animal for some reason, but then  
17 the other part of this is that some people, you know, they  
18 intentionally harvest an animal and then waste the animal,  
19 leave the animal. But the other part is that they cannot do  
20 anything about it, no matter what they do.

21  
22 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

23  
24 INTERPRETER NICK: Are there any other  
25 comments regarding wanton waste?

26  
27 (No audible responses)

28  
29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Quayana, Chuck.

30  
31 INTERPRETER NICK: Quayana.

32  
33 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

34  
35 INTERPRETER NICK: Tim Andrew from AVCP is  
36 going to give a testimony.

37  
38 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. (In  
39 Yup'ik)

40  
41 INTERPRETER NICK: My name is Tim Andrew, I  
42 work in -- I work for AVCP Natural Resources, I'm not very  
43 verbal in Yup'ik, but I'm going to try the best I can.

44  
45 MR. T. ANDREW: So I'm going to do this in  
46 English.

47  
48 Several years ago there was an elder from Marshall  
49 that told me a story that one time him and his grandpa went  
50 out hunting up the Yukon River. They went several miles

00024

1 above Marshall and they caught a black bear. And while they  
2 were skinning out the black bear, you know, this was during  
3 the summer, they were eating quite a bit of fish during the  
4 summer, and while they were skinning out the black bear this  
5 elder thought, boy, this is going to be a great change from  
6 eating fish throughout the summer. And he said he was tired  
7 of eating fish and he was looking forward to eating the black  
8 bear for dinner, for lunch for the next several days.

9  
10 But when they were skinning the black bear his  
11 grandpa was cutting up in little pieces and all of a sudden a  
12 boat came down the river, while they was cutting it into  
13 little pieces. The boat landed and his grandpa gave all this  
14 meat away to these people that were in the boat and shared it  
15 with this family that may have needed it. And the guy told  
16 me that he was really disappointed at his grandpa for doing  
17 that because he was looking forward to eating this black bear  
18 meat for several days.

19  
20 But the story behind -- or the issue behind that is,  
21 you know, we used to share, we used to share everything that  
22 we got before we got the freezers. It kind of brought  
23 something into mind when I was thinking about this story, you  
24 know, with the advent of the freezers that we got now. We,  
25 as Yup'ik people, although we continue to share, we still put  
26 away large amounts of food, you know, just for the winter and  
27 just for the upcoming year.

28  
29 So it kind of leaves us with a lot of opportunities  
30 to put away for ourselves and for our family. But that's  
31 beside the point of this wanton waste issue. You know,  
32 although freezers are not totally responsible for the wanton  
33 waste, it's a human issue and many times it's -- you know, we  
34 may blame our young people, but yet we've got to look at some  
35 of our older generation that need to teach the younger people  
36 how not to waste food.

37  
38 As Chuck said in his report, that some of us need to  
39 teach our younger people that, you know, there's different  
40 parts of the moose, different parts of the caribou, different  
41 of bear, fish, that we may not eat ourselves, but other  
42 people do eat.

43  
44 The last person that was supposed to be working with  
45 the Fish and Wildlife Service in development of this wanton  
46 waste issue, information and education to the public, was  
47 Michelle Sparcks. Unfortunately she left in December of 1998  
48 to go back to Washington, D.C., where she is currently  
49 employed by AVCP as the congressional liaison staff person in  
50 Washington, D.C.



00025

1 But before she left she worked with Mike Reardon and  
2 also with Billy McCann in the presentation of -- over KYAK,  
3 however, it hasn't ever really gone beyond that point.

4  
5 This wanton waste issue, I will continue to work on  
6 it with Fish and Wildlife Service and with the Alaska  
7 Department of Fish and Game, however, you know, with limited  
8 staff we've hardly had an opportunity to address this issue,  
9 but with -- hopefully in filling her position that it will  
10 leave a lot more time for us to work on this issue.

11  
12 There's been some recent developments on this wanton  
13 waste issue. At a Regional Fish and Game Advisory Committee  
14 meeting held in Stony River many, many people brought up  
15 complaints about people hunting moose, especially the people  
16 that hunting moose in unguided trips. These are people  
17 coming in from the Outside hunting and there's nobody telling  
18 them which ones to shoot -- which animals to shoot. And most  
19 of the people up in the middle part of the Kuskokwim River,  
20 up around the Stony River area complain about the rotting  
21 smell of moose, even coming into the villages.

22  
23 And the Board -- according to Michelle, the Board did  
24 not choose to address this issue because it didn't want to  
25 point the fingers toward the unguided hunt. But we are  
26 continuing working with the Alaska Department of Fish and  
27 Game and Fish and Wildlife Service to reinforce hunting  
28 guidelines and regulation hunters coming into the state.

29  
30 At the Western Alaska Brown Bear Management Area  
31 meeting held last spring in Bethel, one of the members also  
32 brought up the issue of hunting bears just for the gall  
33 bladder. And many of the people at that meeting pointed the  
34 finger towards the younger people or the younger hunters that  
35 were behaving in this manner. That obviously sparked a lot  
36 of debate within the WABBMA members and said that this was  
37 dishonoring the bear's spirit and it was also disrespectful  
38 to our subsistence way of life. So the wanton waste issue is  
39 not condoned by Western Alaska Brown Bear Management Area or  
40 AVCP or any of the people in this area.

41  
42 If you would recall several years ago up in the  
43 northern parts of Alaska there were some people that went out  
44 and hunted walrus and cut their head off and just let them  
45 there to waste. That issue has been plaguing us for many,  
46 many year, and it will probably continue to plague us and  
47 we're stilling feeling the effects of it.

48  
49 For this issue, we need to address it, I agree with  
50 Chuck Hunt, that we need to get into the villages and remind

00026

1 people that we are people that are not supposed to be wasting  
2 ammo -- or wasting -- or wanton wasting animals, because  
3 these are foods that we depend on.

4

5 Guyana. If anybody has any questions, I'll be more  
6 than happy to answer them.

7

8 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

9

10 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

11

12 MR. L. WILDE: Tim, seems to me, if I  
13 remember right, was there a resolution concerning this passed  
14 also during the AFN Convention, didn't the delegation pass  
15 that -- a resolution to some effect concerning wanton waste?  
16 It seems like I.....

17

18 MR. T. ANDREW: Yeah, there -- I think there  
19 was one resolution, but I can't recall exactly.

20

21 MR. L. WILDE: I thought it was AVCP that  
22 introduced the resolution, I wasn't sure.

23

24 MR. T. ANDREW: Yeah, it may have been geared  
25 toward the unguided hunt, I mean, to do away with the  
26 unguided hunt portion because some of the people, like I said  
27 earlier, up in the upper parts of the Kuskokwim River,  
28 there's been people that have cut off the head and just leave  
29 the rest of the meat to rot. Or brought the meat to the  
30 villages and left it at the airport, but people in the  
31 villages don't want the meat because it's so spoiled and  
32 rotten.

33

34 My plans for my department is to introduce a  
35 resolution at the next AVCP Convention be held in Bethel or a  
36 place designated by the Executive Board to address the wanton  
37 waste issue, just so that we get this information to all  
38 tribal governments within the area. And we will continue to  
39 work with our Tribal Councils as well.

40

41 MR. L. WILDE: I feel that this issue is real  
42 important and we can't blame anybody, we have only ourselves  
43 to blame for not telling our children, so it's got to be the  
44 practice of everyone of us, no matter what age we are, to  
45 make sure that this passed on to children, because our kids  
46 don't know any better, unless they have been told by their  
47 parent about how to handle our subsistence game, it's going  
48 to keep going on, so it depends on all of us. We can't just  
49 put the blame on young kids, you know, it's partly our fault  
50 too.

00027

1 MR. CHURCH: Mr. Chairman.

2  
3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Willard.

4  
5 MR. CHURCH: This may not be addressed to  
6 AVCP, but I think I should address it to Mike with the State  
7 of Alaska, Department of Subsistence. How does the State  
8 define the definition for wanton waste in regards to fish?  
9 This may be a controversial question because of the way that  
10 there are different groups of users out there that use the  
11 fish resource, both subsistence and sport. Because when you  
12 look at the definition for Federal it talks about injury as  
13 well killing the fowl or the big game animals. And how  
14 should we define it for sport caught and released or  
15 subsistence caught fish?

16  
17 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Mike Coffing,  
18 Fish and Game Subsistence. I'm a little hesitant to give you  
19 what I remember being the definition of wanton waste, unless  
20 I had it in front of me to read, because it's essentially a  
21 legal definition and I do not have that in front of me.

22  
23 But, I guess, maybe to paraphrase, an understanding  
24 of wanton waste is that if a person harvests an animal or  
25 fish, fish or wildlife, and doesn't see that that wildlife is  
26 used, then it's wanton waste. If you catch fish and you  
27 leave them in your boat and you go off and leave them and sun  
28 is on them and they get spoiled, that's an example of wanton  
29 waste. It may be with total regard of what's happening or it  
30 may be just through neglect, or not following through, that's  
31 how I would characterize wanton waste.

32  
33 The question about wanton waste and sport caught  
34 fish, wanton waste in sport caught fish, I think it's no  
35 different. If a person harvests an animal or fish and  
36 doesn't use it properly, takes parts of it, leaves parts of  
37 it, that are required to be harvested and use, and that's  
38 wanton waste. It doesn't matter whether you're a commercial  
39 fisherman, a subsistence fisherman, a sports fisherman, a  
40 recreational fisherman or who you are, if you harvest an  
41 animal you need to use it properly.

42  
43 And I think we all understand what the proper use of  
44 fish and wildlife is here and we're real sensitive to that,  
45 but as many of the Council members have recognized, not every  
46 individual has the same understanding and same sense of  
47 responsibility to that resource in the community as some  
48 other individual, so -- again, I apologize I don't have  
49 something to read to you, I wish I had the codified  
50 regulation to read you wanton waste, because I'd like to have

00028

1 that. I don't think it's in our handy-dandy books that we  
2 have with us, so -- I'll be glad to get that for you though,  
3 Willard, and get that to the Council members if the Council  
4 so desires.

5  
6 Thanks.

7  
8 MR. CHURCH: Thank you.

9  
10 MR. CHARLES: Mr. Chairman.

11  
12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Charles.

13  
14 MR. CHARLES: Mike, so it's a responsibility  
15 of the person who shoots a game, if they shoot animals, like  
16 for a sports hunter, he will shoot the game for antlers only  
17 and don't care for the meat, so it's his responsibility to  
18 give the meat away or whatever wants to?

19  
20 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Mike Coffing  
21 again, Fish and Game. Yeah, in that example, James, a sports  
22 hunter or any hunter that shoots an animal is responsible for  
23 all of that animal. Not just the antlers. They're  
24 responsible for seeing that the meat is properly -- that the  
25 animal is properly field dressed, that the meat is taken care  
26 of, it's hung, it's preserved and transported in a way that  
27 it can be used for human food. That's their responsibility.

28  
29 There's some and I'm not -- you know, again, not  
30 being a protection officer or being an attorney, I'm treading  
31 kind of out of my expertise here, but for hunters that are  
32 guided, that have a guide with them, there's some liability  
33 that falls on the guide for that. So, for example, if a  
34 hunter has hired a guide and through negligence of the guide  
35 or just, you know, carelessness of the guide or whatever,  
36 that meat is not properly taken care of and is wasted, the  
37 guide bears some liability as well and can have penalties or  
38 revocation of his guide license as well. So that's an  
39 example where it falls on, maybe, a couple of people, but  
40 essentially it's the responsibility initially of the hunter,  
41 the person that's harvesting the animal.

42  
43 MR. CHARLES: Yeah. For example, a long time  
44 ago, maybe about 30 years ago a guy gave me the meat and I  
45 didn't care for that meat. There was a trophy hunter with me  
46 and I was subsistence hunting and we were in the same plane.  
47 Before the regulations changed we could shoot cows them days  
48 or shoot a moose on the same day before the regulations  
49 changed, so that guy and I were in one plane, trophy hunter  
50 and me a subsistence hunter. I wanted to shoot a cow because

00029

1 cow was open that time and this guy was looking for a big  
2 bull and he shot the big bull and took the antlers and the  
3 pilot gave me the meat and I didn't care for it, so -- them  
4 days I didn't want tough meat anyway, but I took the  
5 meat.....

6  
7 MR. COFFING: Uh-huh.

8  
9 MR. CHARLES: .....because they didn't know  
10 what to do with it.

11  
12 MR. CHARLES: I understand, Mr. Chairman.  
13 James, and again, it's the person who harvest who the animal  
14 is responsible. And if a hunter or a guide has meat that  
15 wants to give you and you don't want it, that still their  
16 responsibility. And none of us want to see meat wasted so  
17 maybe we take it because they don't know what to do with it,  
18 but they have to be thinking about that before they go  
19 hunting. We don't hunt things that we don't need, right. We  
20 go hunting because we need food and for people that may be  
21 hunting for trophies, I think they need to think about what  
22 they're going to do with that meat before they ever kill the  
23 animal.

24  
25 If a person does give you meat, in the back of the  
26 State hunting book there is a form that you can fill out  
27 called a "Transfer of Meat" and if that meat is transferred  
28 to you -- for example, if a hunter shoots a moose and wants  
29 to give you a hind leg, he can do that. The State says you  
30 have to fill out a paper showing that it was transferred to  
31 you, that you just didn't shoot a cow or didn't shoot a  
32 moose, take only the leg. That's your proof to protect you.  
33 But once that meat has been transferred to you or to another  
34 individual, then that individual is responsible for it. So,  
35 I think you understand.

36  
37 MR. CHARLES: Thank you.

38  
39 MR. McCANN: Mr. Chairman.

40  
41 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Billy.

42  
43 MR. McCANN: And, Mike, what about the  
44 airlines, like taking the antlers out and it happens to these  
45 hunters whose got horns only, what happens to the pilot  
46 taking care that person for hunting, sports hunting, make  
47 sure he gets the meat with the person or what the law on  
48 that, by the pilot, commercial pilot?

49  
50 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Billy. Again,

00030

1 I'm probably reaching out side of my expertise, because I'm  
2 not an enforcement person, but I do know that for guys and  
3 outfitters and some transporters, and maybe a company like --  
4 well, like -- I guess I'll use MarkAir because they're not  
5 around any more. If MarkAir would advertise to fly hunters  
6 out and drop hunters off they would be considered a  
7 transporter. And the way the law is now, transporters are  
8 required to fill out a form showing what pieces of meat they  
9 have on their plane when they pick a hunter up. And if it's  
10 not there, then I suppose the transporter can elect not to  
11 pick the hunter up.

12  
13 But there's some recording of what's being hauled and  
14 that gets turned in. I don't know how much checking there's  
15 done at, like, Bethel or Aniak, but I know specifically in  
16 Anchorage, like at Lake Hood, places there, there are Fish  
17 and Game and Fish and Wildlife people there checking a lot  
18 for fly-in hunters that come in and get dropped off, the get  
19 brought back to the airport there. They're there checking  
20 aircraft and looking for that piece of paper that the pilot  
21 and the company has to have filled out.

22  
23 So there's some attempt to try to keep an eye on  
24 that. I suppose it comes down to how good an airline or a  
25 particular pilot person is about being honest and following  
26 the rules, too.

27  
28 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John.

29  
30 MR. THOMPSON: Since you mentioned those  
31 things, there should not be any sticky language on that to  
32 fight over it, there should be a language, a narrative  
33 language to protect the game. The way it sounds, it's a  
34 broad language, so called "sticky language." Just because  
35 you give meat to a person, he's responsible. How about the  
36 killer? No longer responsible. That's sticky language.

37  
38 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Thompson,  
39 just to clarify, again, the person that kills the animal is  
40 always responsible, there's no escaping that, they're always  
41 responsible, but what I was trying to get across with  
42 transferring the meat. If I shoot an animal, using myself as  
43 an example, and I give the meat to someone, it's in real good  
44 shape, I give that to them and they go take it back to their  
45 camp and they throw it in the brush and they don't use it, I  
46 shouldn't be the blame for that. I took good care of it, now  
47 they're responsible.

48  
49 So the person that kills the animal is always  
50 responsible in seeing that it's properly taken care of until

00031

1 it's home in the freezer or shared or given out, but I can't  
2 be responsible for what someone else does, then that person  
3 is responsible.

4  
5 So the language is pretty specific, a hunter is  
6 responsible is he has the meat until it's transferred and  
7 then whoever has that meat they have an obligation, too, to  
8 be sure it get properly taken care of and used.

9  
10 MR. THOMPSON: There is a sheet of paper that  
11 they could do away with it, which would be allowed. A form.

12  
13 MR. COFFING: There is.

14  
15 MR. McCANN: Sound like to me that -- give  
16 away the meat, a hunter give away the meat. Do hunters have  
17 a form with them to fill out the form or they have to write  
18 their own form to turn over to the someone? It seems like to  
19 me -- just like myself, I don't know how to write, if I don't  
20 have a form, if you just give the meat with out giving  
21 anything. Maybe it should be a form what the sport hunter  
22 requested to fill out the form, make sure that the form goes  
23 where this is going.

24  
25 MR. COFFING: Uh-huh.

26  
27 MR. McCANN: Where the form goes after that,  
28 fill out the form.

29  
30 MR. COFFING: Uh-huh.

31  
32 MR. McCANN: Fish and Wildlife gets it or  
33 somebody else, who does that?

34  
35 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, let me, if I can,  
36 just get my regulation book and I'll show you what the form  
37 looks like.

38  
39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik) Go ahead.

40  
41 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, thank you. In  
42 response to Mr. McCann's question. Billy, there is a form in  
43 the final page -- actually that's two forms, it's half a page  
44 long in the back of that. But you don't have to have that.  
45 If you got a matchbook, a piece of paper, brown paper sack,  
46 you can just write out, you know, I, Mike Coffing, give Billy  
47 McCann one hind leg of moose on this date. I sign it, you  
48 sign it, I have one, you have one, and that's all you know,  
49 so it can be real simple.

50

00032

1 But it's to protect you or protect the hunter as well  
2 as the person getting the meat. If I show up in Bethel and  
3 all I've got is moose antlers and one front leg and Fish and  
4 Wildlife Protection check me, they're going to say, where's  
5 the ribs, where's the back, where's the other meat? "Well, I  
6 gave it to Billy." "How do I know you gave it to Billy?"  
7 "Well, here, here's the paper where it says I gave it to  
8 Billy." That protects me so I don't get a ticket. Otherwise  
9 he thinks I left it out in the field someplace.

10  
11 MR. THOMPSON: Supposing you are a sportsman.  
12 Okay, you give me the hind legs and the rest of the meat is  
13 left out in the bush, who gets the case [sic], me or you?

14  
15 MR. COFFING: Who has the what?

16  
17 MR. THOMPSON: Who is responsible for that  
18 meat?

19  
20 MR. COFFING: The hunter, not you.

21  
22 MR. THOMPSON: Not me? Even though I got the  
23 hind quarter?

24  
25 MR. COFFING: You're only responsible for the  
26 hind quarter.

27  
28 MR. THOMPSON: Just for the hind quarter?

29  
30 MR. COFFING: Yeah.

31  
32 MR. THOMPSON: How about rest of the meat?

33  
34 MR. COFFING: The hunter is responsible for  
35 the rest of the meat, so if you know a hunter left some out  
36 in the field, didn't take it, there's an 800 number you can  
37 call, don't have to give your name, and turn him in.

38  
39 MR. THOMPSON: Well, he say, well, I gave  
40 everything to you and you will report me.

41  
42 MR. COFFING: Well, that's where the paper  
43 will protect you, because it has what parts you received from  
44 him.

45  
46 MR. CHURCH: Mr. Chairman.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Willard.

49  
50 MR. CHURCH: So they way that I understand it



00033

1 here is for Native recipients of sport hunted big game, it is  
2 best for them if they receive this and accept it, that they  
3 make sure that this sport hunter gives them this piece of  
4 paper that outlines exactly what was given to them for their  
5 protection, just in case this hunter may let his meat rot or  
6 dispose of it?

7

8 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Mike Coffing  
9 again. I guess, Willard, the way I would characterize it is  
10 if somebody was hunting -- let's say Billy was hunting and  
11 gave you a bag of meat and you have it in your home in  
12 Quinhagak, there's probably not going to be a problem if you  
13 don't have any paper, because no one is going to, maybe,  
14 check your house. But if he gives you a hind leg of a moose,  
15 you're in your boat and you're coming down river, and you  
16 don't have your harvest ticket punched and you got no paper  
17 to say that Billy gave it to you, the Protection officer  
18 might think "Willard shot a moose, he only took the hind leg,  
19 and left the rest in the field." So he's going to write you  
20 a ticket. So it can protect you.

21

22 But it's also -- it's important that the hunters that  
23 are giving it away, you know, gets that filled out as well,  
24 because it protects him if he doesn't have all the meat and  
25 he gets checked, he's going get potentially cited for that  
26 for not having the meat with him, if he can't prove that he  
27 got it and gave it to somebody.

28

29 Essentially the reason for this is what we're talking  
30 about, is to help prevent wanton waste and to be able to  
31 enforce people that are not bringing all the meat out of the  
32 field and using it properly.

33

34 MR. L. WILDE: Mike, the problem with that is  
35 not everybody has a fax machine out in the wilderness where  
36 they could get a copy of that paper so they could give it to  
37 somebody else. Sometimes you have to rely on the word of  
38 people that are the recipients or the hunters of that game.  
39 So I think -- I know it's not just your say or my say has to  
40 be done is going to be done, but I think that should be taken  
41 into consideration. Also, if it can be published in your  
42 little book of golden rules that your Protection people live  
43 by, it would help some, I think.

44

45 MR. COFFING: Well, I agree with that, I  
46 think if we all do what's right we won't need to have all the  
47 regulations printed up paper reports. But again, Lester, it  
48 doesn't have to be that form, it can be simply something you  
49 write down, it can be on a piece of cardboard. Usually  
50 there's a place to find something to write on, you know, it

00034

1 doesn't have to be that one, but.....

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

4

5 INTERPRETER NICK: The Chair asked the  
6 guests, the local residents, if they had any questions or  
7 comment regarding the wanton waste?

8

9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I just asked to see if  
10 there's any more from the Council, anyone?

11

12 (No audible responses)

13

14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, then. Next on  
15 our agenda is old business, B, update on Federal subsistence  
16 fisheries management (staff). You'll find this in your  
17 booklets Tab E. Sue, I recognize you at this time.

18

19 MS. DETWILER: Thank you, Mr. Chair, members  
20 of the Council. My name is Sue Detwiler, I work for the Fish  
21 and Wildlife Service Subsistence office in Anchorage. My job  
22 with the Subsistence office is a couple of things, one is to  
23 do policy and analysis and then the other is to coordinate  
24 the interagency Staff Committee that advises the Federal  
25 Subsistence Board.

26

27 So this agenda item is an update on Federal  
28 subsistence management. I think most people know that the  
29 Federal Subsistence Program is preparing to extend its  
30 jurisdiction to include subsistence fisheries on many of the  
31 navigable waters in the state. It's a result of the Katie  
32 John court decision which was made by the Federal courts back  
33 in 1995. Up until 1995, the Federal Program did not manage  
34 fisheries in navigable waters.

35

36 Katie John, an Athabascan elder from Copper River  
37 area challenged that decision, saying that Title VIII should  
38 apply to subsistence fisheries. The Federal courts agreed in  
39 1995, which meant that the Federal Program had to broaden to  
40 include subsistence fisheries in navigable waters, certain  
41 navigable waters.

42

43 Since 1995, though, when the court decision was  
44 handed down, Congress has prevented us from actually  
45 implementing the Katie John decision. They prevented us in a  
46 series of moratoriums. We're currently under another  
47 moratorium which Congress enacted in late 1998. That  
48 moratorium prevents us from implementing until October 1 of  
49 this year, but it has a little bit more stronger incentives  
50 for the State to resume authority for subsistence management.

00035

1           The current moratorium provides in for phased in  
2 Federal assumption of subsistence management. And it also  
3 provides funding which hasn't been provided for, for  
4 subsistence fisheries management. Congress has allocated \$11  
5 million for subsistence fisheries. If the State Legislature  
6 approves a constitutional amendment for the next general  
7 election ballot that would bring the State into compliance  
8 with Title VIII, then the State will get the 11 million. If  
9 they act by July 1st of this year.

10  
11           If they don't act, the Federal Subsistence Program  
12 will get one million of that \$11 million and use it to  
13 prepare for implementation. If the State Legislature then,  
14 subsequently acts by September 30th of this year, to bring  
15 the State into compliance with ANILCA, then the State will  
16 get the remaining \$10 million, but if the Legislature does  
17 not act by September 30th of this year, then the Federal  
18 agencies will get the remaining \$10 million for a total of  
19 \$11 million altogether and we will begin implementation of  
20 subsistence fisheries management on October 1st of this year.

21  
22           We published a Final Rule that incorporates  
23 subsistence fisheries regulations in January of this year.  
24 That rule is final, but it won't take effect until October.  
25 You've seen the Proposed Rule, the Final Rule is pretty much  
26 like the Proposed Rule.

27  
28           The highlights of that rule are that it extends  
29 Federal subsistence fisheries jurisdiction to navigable  
30 waters within which the agencies have reserved water rights.  
31 And so translated that means, we would be assuming  
32 subsistence fisheries management on all navigable waters  
33 within conservation system units. And in this area that  
34 would be all the navigable waters within the Yukon-Kuskokwim  
35 Delta Wildlife Refuge.

36  
37           The new regulations would also expand our  
38 jurisdiction for subsistence fisheries, as well as wildlife,  
39 to private lands, lands that have been selected by but not  
40 yet conveyed to the State and to Native corporations. So if  
41 there are lands out there that have been selected by the  
42 State and Native corporation, but they have not had title  
43 conveyed yet to the State or Native corporations, then those  
44 lands would fall under our jurisdiction as well.

45  
46           Another provision of the regulations is that the  
47 regulations expressly state the Secretaries of Interior and  
48 Agriculture's authority to regulate hunting and fishing and  
49 trapping activities off Federal public lands, if those  
50 activities are interfering with subsistence on Federal public

00036

1 lands.

2

3 The regulations also, permissively, provide for  
4 customary trade. There aren't any prohibitions on customary  
5 trade, other than to make sure that they don't constitute a  
6 significant commercial enterprise. And they state that the  
7 Board will work with the Regional Councils to identify what  
8 constitutes customary trade for each of the regions.

9

10 And then finally, the Final Rule pretty much adopts  
11 the same subsistence fishing regulations, the season, harvest  
12 limits, methods, mean, and customary and traditional use  
13 determination as what the State currently has. So at the  
14 outset of the program in October, our regulations would be  
15 the same as the State regulations and then they would be  
16 changed, as people requested, sent in proposals to change  
17 them.

18

19 We'll be coordinating closely with the Department of  
20 Fish and Game. Our intent is not to create a program that  
21 stands alone and duplicates the State Fisheries Program. We  
22 foresee working with the State, primarily through preseason  
23 management planning to make sure that the Federal subsistence  
24 priority is accommodated in the State's Preseason Management  
25 Plans. And then we would do limited oversight over  
26 subsistence regulating in-season, only on those waters that  
27 are within Federal jurisdiction.

28

29 There is currently a lawsuit that may prevent us from  
30 extending our fisheries responsibility. That's the lawsuit  
31 that was filed by the State Legislative Council on behalf of  
32 the State Legislature. That lawsuit challenges the  
33 constitutionality of Title VIII. The lawsuit was decided  
34 against the Legislative Council, but it's been appealed, so  
35 it's still pending.

36

37 So in preparation for October of this year we're  
38 doing a number of things. One is develop an organizational  
39 structure within our offices to accommodate fisheries  
40 management. Right now we're focused on wildlife, we'll have  
41 to hire additional people with fisheries expertise to work  
42 with the Regional Councils and the staff. We plan to  
43 continue working closely with the State, both the Board of  
44 Fisheries and the Board of Game.

45

46 There are several unresolved issues, such as defining  
47 customary trade by regions. We also need to develop a  
48 regulatory process for submitting and reviewing proposals for  
49 changes to the regulations. And, significantly, for this  
50 region, we will be reviewing the Advisory Council structures

00037

1 to make sure that we have a structure that's coordinated.  
2 This Yukon River, in particular, has three Regional Councils  
3 that deals with fisheries, or that cover the Yukon River and  
4 there's the Yukon River Drainage Fisheries Association that  
5 already has advisory capacity. So we'll have to see how that  
6 advisory structure is going to work.

7  
8 And then the final part of my prepared presentation  
9 was simply to mention to you that we will be looking to  
10 contract out portions of the Federal Subsistence Program for  
11 fisheries, just as we've done for wildlife. We'll be looking  
12 for cooperative agreements with the Native organizations and  
13 tribes for harvest reporting and monitoring and that sort of  
14 thing.

15  
16 Thank you.

17  
18 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any questions to Sue?

19  
20 MR. T. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman.

21  
22 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Tim. Go ahead, Tim.

23  
24 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

25  
26 Sue, what are the plans to coordinate with State  
27 management of commercial fisheries to regulate in those areas  
28 that detrimental affects on our subsistence fisheries, like  
29 the pollock fishery in the Area M?

30  
31 MS. DETWILER: We're doing two things. One  
32 is to work with the State in the preseason management  
33 planning to make sure that the allocations for subsistence  
34 fisheries are appropriate and then as far as other areas,  
35 like Area M, that -- Area M is outside of the Federal  
36 government's geographic jurisdiction, so in order for us to  
37 take action to reduce any of those fisheries it would have to  
38 be proven that those fisheries are detrimentally affecting  
39 fisheries within Federal lands and I think there would have  
40 to be a pretty high burden of proof. I know it's a subject  
41 of pretty hot controversy right now. The Secretary of the  
42 Interior has made it pretty clear that there's a pretty high  
43 standard of proof in order for him to assert jurisdiction off  
44 of his territory.

45  
46 MR. T. ANDREW: A quick follow-up question.  
47 Or pretty much a follow-up comment. There have been several  
48 years in the past that residents of the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta  
49 villages have endured subsistence closures, but yet the sport  
50 fishery continues to (indiscernible - away from microphone)

00038

1 and also the Area M fishery continues with their fishing  
2 activity, despite our subsistence closure. And there are  
3 several reports, one is going to be coming out this month  
4 during the Board of Fishery meeting in Anchorage, I believe,  
5 regarding the intercept rate of fall chum for the Yukon River  
6 and Area M. And also there's many reports on by-catch of  
7 salmon in the pollock fishery. So I'd encourage the Federal  
8 government or Federal managers to utilize those published  
9 resources as proof.

10  
11 MS. DETWILER: Uh-huh.

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Charles, then Johnny.

14  
15 MR. CHARLES: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16  
17 Sue, you mentioned navigable waters, and I was  
18 thinking, because we subsistence fish a lot on lakes. How  
19 big is the lake supposed to be for navigable water?

20  
21 MS. DETWILER: If it's a lake, if you can get  
22 a raft on it, and this is just kind of a general rule.  
23 There's kind of a complicated legal definition that  
24 determines what navigability is, but the general rule is that  
25 I heard is that if you can float a raft on it, then it's  
26 navigable. And for the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta we already have  
27 authority of some navigable waters and of the non-navigable  
28 waters, so this would just add more navigable waters. So  
29 essentially all the waters within the refuge would be under  
30 Federal subsistence.

31  
32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Johnny.

33  
34 MR. THOMPSON: I just want to asks if there's  
35 a section where we could discuss about the fisheries or -- in  
36 our agenda or is this the -- I just wanted to know, so I  
37 could start asking questions. If there's a section where we  
38 could discuss the matter of fish?

39  
40 (In Yup'ik)

41  
42 INTERPRETER NICK: John repeated his question  
43 Yup'ik.

44  
45 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: In agenda, not really.  
46 Only thing we do have State commercial fishery, Dan Bergstrom  
47 here.

48  
49 MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman.

50

00039

1 MR. THOMPSON: The reason why I ask is I  
2 would like to find out about our test site at the Andraefsky.  
3 I want to see daily testing, I think like they had this past  
4 summer.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John, I think commercial  
7 fishery could respond to that. We have them on the agenda  
8 later on.

9  
10 MR. THOMPSON: Okay.

11  
12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: You got a report? Okay.

13  
14 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman

15  
16 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Go ahead, Lester.

17  
18 MR. L. WILDE: Sue, will the Feds have any  
19 jurisdiction on rearing and habitat areas of the fish and  
20 salmon that go up to the habitats, will you have any say on  
21 how that habitat area is treated? For instances, the Big  
22 Delta and Little Delta where the forestry is going on? And  
23 that's the spawning ground of the salmon that go up the Yukon  
24 area that are used for subsistence. Is there any  
25 jurisdictions that you have over things of that nature?

26  
27 MS. DETWILER: The Federal Subsistence Board  
28 only deals with the taking of fish and wildlife, they don't  
29 deal with habitat. The State -- and it depends on where the  
30 habitat is. If the habitat is within a refuge or a park or  
31 forest, then it would be -- the habitat is managed by the  
32 Federal agencies.

33  
34 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Sue, I think some of the  
35 Council couldn't hear you. Will you.

36  
37 MS. DETWILER: I'll try and -- is this any  
38 better?

39  
40 The question was, whether or not the Federal  
41 Subsistence Program would have authority over management of  
42 habitat? And my response is that the Federal Subsistence  
43 Board only manages taking of fish and wildlife, it does not  
44 manage habitat. If the habitat is within a Federal  
45 conservation system unit, like a park or a refuge, it would  
46 manage the habitat, but it's the agency that manages it, the  
47 forest or the park, and if it's outside of those boundaries  
48 then the State manages it.

49  
50 MR. L. WILDE: So no matter what affect the

00040

1 forestry -- if the Department of Forest approved a cutting in  
2 an area they would be the ones to police themselves?

3

4 MS. DETWILER: I'm treading outside of my  
5 territory here, but lands under -- private and State lands,  
6 the main protections for fisheries habitat come under the  
7 State Forest Practices Act. There's a State law that governs  
8 the effects of land practices that is meant to protect  
9 fisheries habitat.

10

11 MR. L. WILDE: So the Feds don't have any  
12 regulations concerning habitat as far as we're concerned?

13

14 MS. DETWILER: It depends on where the fish  
15 that you're talking about are located?

16

17 MR. L. WILDE: Okay. What if it was on  
18 Forestry land?

19

20 MS. DETWILER: If it's in a national forest  
21 or if it's within BLM's areas, that agency is the one with  
22 the primary habitat management responsibility, so you'd have  
23 to find out who owns that land that the fish are spawning in  
24 and then deal with them.

25

26 MR. L. WILDE: Well, the reason I brought  
27 this up was there's -- this has something to do with our  
28 subsistence on the Yukon River and not just the Yukon River,  
29 since the salmon come up down around Hooper Bay, in that  
30 area, we were concerned about the cutting and the forest --  
31 the cutting of the forestry -- what am I trying to say? I'm  
32 trying say there's going to be cutting of trees up in the Big  
33 Delta.....

34

35 MS. DETWILER: right.

36

37 MR. L. WILDE: .....and the Little Delta,  
38 that area.

39

40 MS. DETWILER: Yes.

41

42 MR. L. WILDE: And there's a lot of us that  
43 are concerned about that. We've contacted the Forestry  
44 Service and they don't seem to want to budge one way or the  
45 other. And what you mentioned, it seems to me that the  
46 Forestry Service are the ones that are supposed to be looking  
47 out for the habitat and they seem not to be doing what  
48 they're responsibility is. I mean, in that case, what  
49 happens? They just -- where does our input go from there? I  
50 mean, what value is our input as far as Forestry is



00041

1 concerned, if they're going to go ahead and approve cutting  
2 the forests in our rearing areas of our fish that come  
3 through our.....

4  
5 MS. DETWILER: Yeah. I'm not sure which  
6 particular area you're referring to. But I know that there  
7 is a proposed timber sale up towards Delta, but it's on the  
8 Tanana River and it's called the Surprised Site Sale.

9  
10 MR. L. WILDE: Yeah, that's the area I was  
11 concerned -- there's a lot of us that are concerned about  
12 that area.

13  
14 MS. DETWILER: Uh-huh.

15  
16 MR. L. WILDE: And it seems that no matter  
17 what any of the other organizations tell Forestry Service,  
18 they don't seem to think it matters that much.

19  
20 MS. DETWILER: Yeah, that sale is totally  
21 under State jurisdiction, but my understanding is that the  
22 State has postponed or halted that sale to allow the working  
23 group to get together, it's composed of all the interest  
24 groups, to reach a consensus.

25  
26 MR. L. WILDE: Because one of the -- some  
27 thing going toward the -- to meet the end, that was my  
28 concern.

29  
30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I have to break this up  
31 because the one that are eating in the school, you go only  
32 half an hour to be up there. That's the reason I'm going to  
33 break for -- recess for lunch and you'll be back again and  
34 there's some questions here that need to be answered. Okay?  
35 1:30 we'll be back. 1:30.

36  
37 We're going to break for lunch, the one who staying  
38 at the school, it served only from 11:00 to 11:30, give you a  
39 chance. We'll be back 1:30. And those of you that would  
40 like to ask questions, she'll be here when we start our  
41 meeting again. We'll recess for 1:30.

42  
43 (Off record - 11:08 a.m.)

44  
45 (On record - 1:05 p.m.)

46  
47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

48  
49 INTERPRETER NICK: Anyone who is going to --  
50 who is planning to testify, they must provide a copy right

00042

1 after the testimony.

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: At this time we'll go  
4 back to the meeting. We'll ask Sue, we got some questions of  
5 her.

6

7 John Hanson.

8

9 MR. HANSON: Okay. I got a question on  
10 Federal taking of fisheries after October 1, 1999. What --  
11 if the legislatures don't act on anything on the  
12 Constitution, the amendment of the Constitution, Federal  
13 takes over the fisheries after October 1, 1999, what affect  
14 will that do, say, the Yukon, the Kuskokwim, Nushagak River,  
15 Naknek River, Togiak, what big change will be there be on the  
16 fisheries?

17

18 MS. DETWILER: We're not expecting any  
19 changes. We're anticipating that -- subsistence fisheries  
20 are already going on under State regulations. And not only  
21 that, but they account for one or two percent, at the most,  
22 of the fisheries going on statewide, so we're not  
23 anticipating any increase in allocation of fisheries that  
24 would impact any of the other sport or commercial fisheries.

25

26 MR. HANSON: So you're saying that if the  
27 Federal takes over, besides the subsistence fishery, they're  
28 not going to take the commercial fishery?

29

30 MS. DETWILER: No, we would only be,  
31 basically, managing the existing subsistence fishery. It  
32 would just switch hands from ADF&G to the Federal government,  
33 it wouldn't change anything else.

34

35 MR. CHURCH: Mr. Chairman.

36

37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Willard.

38

39 MR. CHURCH: Sue, I'd like for you to  
40 elaborate a little more on co-management opportunities for  
41 tribal governments and Native organizations. Kind of explain  
42 what kinds of programs would be available.

43

44 MS. DETWILER: We would be asking for --  
45 providing opportunities for cooperative agreements, just as  
46 we are with the wildlife harvesting agreements that we have  
47 right now. And, basically, what we're looking at right now  
48 is we haven't defined exactly what we would be contracting  
49 out, but it would be along the lines of the harvest  
50 reporting, where we contract out to AVCP or other subregional

00043

1 non-profits to collect harvest information, do subsistence  
2 use studies, characterizing the existing subsistence uses,  
3 that sort of thing.

4 And the other thing I would add to that is that my  
5 understanding from what's being said at the higher levels at  
6 Washington, D.C. and on down, is that there will be even more  
7 of an emphasis on contracting out some of those functions  
8 than there was under wildlife, so there'll be more  
9 opportunities for that.

10  
11 And I would just add one more thing, and that is  
12 partially do to the realization that we have to rely on local  
13 knowledge to do a lot of that, we just can't do it ourselves.

14  
15 MR. CHURCH: I know in a lot of Federal  
16 agencies there's language which specifically says in regards  
17 to co-management where they are willing to work with  
18 commissions, committees, consortiums, but with this plan here  
19 for subsistence fisheries, is there language which  
20 specifically says that you would be willing to work with  
21 tribes?

22  
23 MS. DETWILER: The language is in Section 809  
24 of ANILCA, and I don't remember what the specific language  
25 is, but it specifically mentions Native organizations, I'm  
26 not sure if it mentions tribes or not.

27  
28 MR. CHURCH: Yeah. I wouldn't mind having  
29 that defined and clarified because I know there are tribal  
30 governments out in rural areas that have infrastructure in  
31 place ready to take on more co-management opportunities. And  
32 I think that those same tribes should be given preference  
33 over commissions, committees and consortiums and intertribal  
34 agencies, because they are the governing bodies of the  
35 community and the Native group that they are government for.

36  
37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

38  
39 MR. THOMPSON: My question is questioned  
40 already.

41  
42 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

43  
44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

45  
46 MR. L. WILDE: The other day we were  
47 discussing on fisheries in the navigable waters, the Yukon  
48 River. What you just said, does that clarify our mind in  
49 stating that you would have nothing or you would not be  
50 controlling the commercial fisheries on the Yukon River, that

00044

1 would be left up to the State?

2

3 MS. DETWILER: That's correct.

4

5 MR. L. WILDE: Or, as far as commercial  
6 fisheries goes, in any of the Federally upgrade waters within  
7 this area?

8

9 MS. DETWILER: We would not be controlling  
10 commercial fisheries anyway.

11

12 MR. L. WILDE: Anywhere?

13

14 MS. DETWILER: Uh-huh (affirmative).

15

16 MR. L. WILDE: Okay. Thank you.

17

18 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John.

19

20 MR. HANSON: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
21 I'd like to get this clarified. They sent me this from the  
22 Federal Subsistence Board and where it says what waters will  
23 be affected and it says the regulations will apply on any  
24 land which is in the Federal land boundaries, just like the  
25 national wildlife refuges and the others, Togiak National  
26 one. Does this mean -- well, it says, wildlife refuge,  
27 national parks, monuments, preserves, national conservation  
28 and recreation areas, national wildlife and scenic river  
29 corridors, National Petroleum Reserve in Alaska, Chugach and  
30 Tongass National Forests and the jurisdiction will extend to  
31 the waters following [sic] through State, private and Alaska  
32 Native corporation lands.

33

34 Does that mean when the Federal takes over  
35 subsistence fisheries they will have all these outfits,  
36 including the corporations lands, will they let the Native  
37 corporations know that they'll be taking care of the  
38 subsistence fishery in their jurisdictions?

39

40 MS. DETWILER: The only Native corporation  
41 land that it would apply to would be the land that has not  
42 yet been conveyed to those Native corporations.

43

44 MR. HANSON: Okay.

45

46 MS. DETWILER: And within the refuges, if  
47 there is water going through Native corporation land, it  
48 would extend to those waters as well. We wouldn't be  
49 managing for subsistence on Native corporation lands within  
50 the refuge that have been conveyed.

00045

1 MR. HANSON: So what in the Y-K Delta, the  
2 Native corporation lands they go on both sides of the river,  
3 so whether it's in Kuskokwim, whether it's in Togiak or  
4 whether it's in Kotlik, the river goes right in between their  
5 lands.

6  
7 MS. DETWILER: Those waters would be  
8 included. Those lands, if they're conveyed to the  
9 corporations wouldn't be included, but the waters that go  
10 through all the corporation lands would be included.

11  
12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Tim.

13  
14 MR. T. ANDREW: Yes, I've got a question. If  
15 for some reason (indiscernible - away from microphone) is  
16 there perhaps some safety nets in which the subsistence user  
17 can rely on if the State isn't in compliance with, you know,  
18 if there, like, an annual overview by the Secretary?

19  
20 MS. DETWILER: Yes, that's a good question.  
21 There are two mechanisms for the Secretary of the Interior to  
22 make sure that the State is complying with ANILCA and one is  
23 the report that's required by Section 806 of ANILCA and that  
24 is yearly report that talks about how the State is  
25 implementing it, implementing a subsistence priority.

26  
27 And then there's a report that's required by Section  
28 813, which is done every three years.

29  
30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik) Thank you.

31  
32 Next on our agenda is still old business, update on  
33 the results of village meetings on migratory bird management.  
34 Staff is supposed to report this, but we're going to delay  
35 until Chuck Hunt will be -- he'll get to it when we get to  
36 later on.

37  
38 Now, we're on D in our agenda, update on cooperative  
39 agreement. (Pat McClenahan) Is anyone here that's suppose  
40 to be.....

41  
42 MS. DETWILER: Mr. Chair, Pat McClenahan was  
43 going to try to be connected by teleconference today, and I  
44 guess the phone lines are out until 3:00, but I'm prepared to  
45 go over some of the materials that she was going to go over  
46 with you, but not the cooperative agreements.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: So we will delay this  
49 until next meeting?

50

00046

1 MS. DETWILER: Mr. Chair, we may be able to  
2 connect with Pat after 3:00 when the lines go back up.

3  
4 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: We'll, just skip that  
5 until late, hook up with Pat later.

6  
7 Next is E, update on C&T Working Group  
8 recommendation. Is that one, too, or you can take that?

9  
10 Thank you.

11  
12 MS. DETWILER: I can give you a brief  
13 overview on this, but if you have more questions you might  
14 have to ask Pat.

15  
16 The C&T Working Group was established at the request  
17 of the Councils and the Board at their joint meeting last  
18 May. The Regional Councils had various problems with the way  
19 that we were dealing with the customary and traditional use  
20 determination process. And basically, customary and  
21 traditional use determinations are the second tool for  
22 identifying which communities have a subsistence priority.  
23 The first tier is they have to be rural, and for some species  
24 in the state there's a second tier, which is customary and  
25 traditional use determination.

26  
27 If a community has been determined to have customary  
28 and traditional use of a species then they're eligible for  
29 the Federal subsistence priority. And there are eight  
30 factors that the Board and the Regional Councils use to  
31 determine whether or not a community had customary and  
32 traditional use. And the problem that the Councils have had  
33 with the customary and traditional use determination were,  
34 basically, different ways of applying those criteria,

35  
36 The Eastern Interior Regional Council, for instance,  
37 didn't want to use customary and traditional use  
38 determinations at all. They felt like it pitted one  
39 community against another when they would have to determine  
40 whether one community had customary and traditional use of a  
41 species and others didn't. So they, basically, wanted to by-  
42 pass customary and traditional use determinations and make  
43 just a broad sweeping generalization that all communities  
44 within a region and the adjacent subunits have C&T.

45  
46 Then another problem with C&T determinations was the  
47 different level of importance that was placed on the  
48 technical information as opposed to traditional knowledge in  
49 making C&T determinations.

50

00047

1           So there were problems with the C&T process and so a  
2 working group was established that was composed of Mitch, Dan  
3 O'Hara from Bristol Bay Regional Council, Craig Fleener from  
4 Eastern Interior and Bill Thomas from Southeast and then a  
5 couple of Board -- Staff Committee or Board members were on  
6 the committee as well.

7  
8           They met three times and they identified three areas  
9 of concern. They had their final meeting last November and  
10 you have the briefing in your book. They identified three  
11 areas of concern. One was to sort of reemphasize the  
12 importance of traditional knowledge as opposed to the  
13 technical information that's usually collected in the  
14 documentation that we have available. The second issue was -  
15 - had to do with multiple species analyses versus doing  
16 analysis species by species. And the third issue had to do  
17 with differences between the regions. Some regions were much  
18 more demanding in wanting technical infor -- more reliance on  
19 technical information, whereas other regions were wanting to  
20 focus more on traditional knowledge and not focus so much on  
21 the documentation that is in the eight factors.

22  
23           So the recommendation from that working group was to  
24 keep the C&T determination process and then it'll be  
25 evaluated again, if need be, after we begin to implement  
26 fisheries management.

27  
28           That's all.

29  
30           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Does anyone have a  
31 question for Sue at this time? I think earlier you were  
32 saying, Sue, that any question would be directed to Pat  
33 McClenahan when she's on?

34  
35           MS. DETWILER: Yes.

36  
37           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. So we'll leave  
38 that.

39  
40           Next on the agenda is 1998 Annual Report update,  
41 addition or any other issues, approval. John Andrew.

42  
43           MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman, last time (In  
44 Yup'ik)

45  
46           INTERPRETER NICK: John Andrew is reporting  
47 that even though the Council has not reviewed and acted upon  
48 the Annual Report. He has a written annual report, page  
49 seven -- he has a seven page annual report for the year 1998.

50

1           The Councils met twice last year in Bethel. The  
2 Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory Council held its fall and  
3 winter meeting in Bethel. We have Willard Church from  
4 Quinhagak and Robert Nick from Nunapitchuk as our new  
5 members. Fritz George from Akiachuak was reappointed. We  
6 also have to alternates, John Hanson. Sr. from Alakanuk and  
7 Thadius Tikiun from Bethel. We have five seats to fill this  
8 year during our nomination process. The Council meets during  
9 the month of October and the Council nominates and elects a  
10 Chair, Vice Chair and Secretary and a Sergeant-at-Arms every  
11 year. Elections were held resulting in the following  
12 officers and members.

13  
14           Chair, Harry Wilde, Sr.; Vice Chair, Paul John;  
15 Secretary, Fritz George; Members, Willard Church, Paul  
16 Manumik, Sr., Ilarion Nicolai, James Charles, Robert Nick,  
17 Johnny B. Thompson, Sr., Billy McCann and Lester Wilde.  
18 Alternates from Kuskokwim, from Bethel, Thadius Tikiun, two  
19 year term. And the Yukon alternate John Hanson, Sr., three  
20 year term

21  
22                               Summary of Annual Activities  
23

24           March 3 to 4, 1998: The Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional  
25 Advisory Council received reports from State and Federal fish  
26 and wildlife agencies on items of interest in the Yukon-  
27 Kuskokwim region. The Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory  
28 Council also reviewed and made recommendations on a proposal  
29 affecting our region.

30  
31           Proposal 62, submitted by the Akiak and Akiachak IRA  
32 Councils, requested a positive customary and traditional use  
33 findings for the communities of Akiak and Akiachak in Unit  
34 18.

35                               By consent agenda action the Board voted  
36 unanimously to defer action on the proposal until the  
37 subsistence studies were done for the villages of Akiak and  
38 Akiachak. The Board action was consistent with the  
39 recommendations of the Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory  
40 Council.

41  
42           Proposal 62, submitted by Togiak National Wildlife  
43 Refuge, request to close a portion of Unit 18 on Federal  
44 public lands in the Arolik River to remove a regulatory  
45 loophole.

46  
47                               The Board supported the staff recommendations  
48 to close the portion of the Arolik River to remove regulatory  
49 loophole. The Yukon-Kuskokwim recommendation differed from  
50 the Board decision; the Council vote was to keep the area



00049

1 open for fear of a closure trap.

2

3 RFR 97-12, submitted by the Alaska Department of Fish  
4 and Game. Request for Reconsideration 97-12, positive  
5 customary and traditional use findings for the villages of  
6 Chevak, Hooper Bay and Scammon Bay for caribou in 22(A).

7

8 The Board opposed the proposal unanimously.  
9 Board action is inclusive of and therefore consistent with  
10 the recommendations of both the Yukon-Kuskokwim and the  
11 Seward Peninsula Regional Advisory Councils.

12

13 Board actions on proposals for other regions  
14 that the Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory  
15 Council passed recommendations on:

16

17 Proposal 64 requested a positive customary and  
18 traditional use determination for black bear in Unit 19 for  
19 residents of Unit 19 and Akiak and Akiachak. The proposal  
20 was submitted by the IRA Councils of Akiak and Akiachak.

21

22 Proposal 65 requested a positive customary and  
23 traditional use determination for black bear in Unit 19 for  
24 rural residents of Units 19(A) and (B). The proposal was  
25 submitted by the Sleetmute Village Council.

26

27 The Board rejected both proposals as  
28 recommended by the Western Interior Regional Council. The  
29 Regional Council made it's recommendation with the intended  
30 benefit of being more inclusive rather than restrictive. The  
31 Regional Council also felt that it would be inappropriate to  
32 restrict communities when black bear are abundant. The  
33 Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Council recommendation was to  
34 support the proposal with the modification to grant a  
35 positive determination for Unit 19 black bear for Unit 19  
36 residents and for residents of Unit 18 within the Kuskokwim  
37 River drainage upstream from and including the Johnson River.  
38 The Board adopted the Western Interior Council's  
39 recommendation and rejected the Yukon-Kuskokwim Council's  
40 recommendation because of Western Interior's recommendation  
41 was more inclusive of subsistence uses.

42

43 Proposal 66, submitted by the IRA Councils of Akiak  
44 and Akiachak, requested a positive customary and traditional  
45 use determination for brown bear in Unit 19 for residents of  
46 Aniak and Akiachak.

47

48 Proposal 67 requested a positive customary and  
49 traditional use determination for caribou for all residents  
50 of Unit 18 for Units 19(A) and (B). The proposal was

00050

1 submitted by the Association of Village Council Presidents  
2 (AVCP).  
3

4 Proposal 68 requested a positive customary and  
5 traditional use determination for caribou in Unit 19 for  
6 residents of Akiak and Akiachak for Unit 19. The proposal  
7 was submitted by the Akiak and Akiachak IRA Councils.  
8

9 Proposal 69 requested a positive customary and  
10 traditional use determination for black bear in Unit 21 for  
11 residents of Unit 23, Tanana and Russian Mission. The  
12 proposal was submitted by the Middle Yukon and Interior  
13 Regional Advisory Councils.  
14

15 Proposal 70 requested a positive customary and  
16 traditional use determination for black bear in Units 21(A)  
17 and (E) for residents of Akiak and Akiachak. The proposal  
18 was submitted by the Akiak and Akiachak IRA Councils.  
19

20 Proposal 71, submitted by the IRA Councils of Akiak  
21 and Akiachak requested a positive and customary use  
22 determination for brown bear in Units 21(A) and (E) for  
23 residents of Akiak and Akiachak.  
24

25 Proposal 72, submitted by the IRA Councils of Akiak  
26 and Akiachak, requested a positive customary and traditional  
27 use determination for caribou in Units 21(A) and (E) for  
28 residents of Akiak and Akiachak.  
29

30 Proposal 73, submitted by the Western Interior  
31 Regional Advisory Council to revise C&T determination  
32 (deferred 1996 Proposal 57A).  
33

34 Proposal 74, submitted by the State Interior Regional  
35 Council to revise a C&T determination (deferred 1996 Proposal  
36 57B)  
37

38 Proposal 75, submitted by the Western Interior  
39 Regional Council, request to align season with the State for  
40 caribou in 21(A).  
41

42 Proposal 51, submitted by the IRA Councils of Akiak  
43 and Akiachak, requests for positive customary and traditional  
44 use determination for black bear in Unit 17.  
45

46 Proposal 52, submitted by IRA Councils of Akiak and  
47 Akiachak, request for positive customary and traditional use  
48 determination for brown bear in Unit 17.  
49

50 Proposal 53, submitted by Akiak and Akiachak IRA

00051

1 Councils, requesting a positive customary and traditional use  
2 finding for Unit 18 communities of Akiak and Akiachak in Unit  
3 17 for caribou.

4  
5 Proposal 54, submitted by the AVCP, requests a  
6 positive customary and traditional use finding for the rural  
7 residents of Unit 18 for caribou in Unit 17(A) and 17(B).  
8 The two proposals were analyzed together.

9  
10 Proposal 55, submitted by the Togiak National  
11 Wildlife Refuge, request removing an area restriction for  
12 caribou in Unit 17.

13  
14 Proposal 58, submitted by Akiak and Akiachak IRA  
15 Councils, requested a positive customary and traditional use  
16 finding for residents of Akiak and Akiachak, located in Unit  
17 18, for moose in Unit 17(B).

18  
19 Proposal 59, submitted by Togiak National Wildlife  
20 Refuge, requested changing Special Action 97-03, to open a  
21 season for moose for Subunit 17(A) on Federal lands.

22  
23 The Federal Subsistence Board voted  
24 unanimously to defer action on the proposal for one year  
25 based on the Bristol Bay Regional Advisory Council's  
26 recommendation to table the proposal until a Moose Management  
27 Plan is developed. The Board expects that a Moose Management  
28 Plan will be in place next year, with direction from a  
29 working subcommittee composed of local councils,  
30 representatives from the Regional Council and Federal and  
31 State agencies. Board action is consistent with the  
32 recommendation of the Bristol Bay Council and is inconsistent  
33 with the recommendation of the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta Regional  
34 Advisory Council, which supported the proposal.

35  
36 Proposal 60, submitted by the Togiak National  
37 Wildlife Refuge, proposed to align moose hunting seasons in  
38 Unit 17 with State seasons.

39  
40 By consent agenda action, the Federal Subsistence  
41 board voted unanimously to support the Bristol Bay Regional  
42 Council's recommendation to support the proposal. Board  
43 action is also consistent with the recommendation of the  
44 Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta Regional Advisory Council.

45  
46 On October 6 and 7, 1998 the Yukon-Kuskokwim  
47 Regional Advisory Council met and conducted annual elections.  
48 Harry O. Wilde, Sr., Chair; Paul John, Vice Chair; Fritz  
49 George, Secretary; and Paul Manumik, Sr. as Sergeant-at-Arms  
50 were elected as officers for the next year.

## 1 Regional Subsistence Issues

2  
3 The Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory Council has  
4 identified the following issues that affect our regions.

5  
6 Issue Number 98-YK-01

7  
8 1. Lower Kuskokwim Moose Management  
9 Plan. This is one sensitive issue that has been off and on  
10 as a topic of discussion in management meetings over the  
11 years. Currently, Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge and  
12 the State Division of Wildlife Conservation, and their  
13 cooperating partners can not get this project off the ground  
14 due to lack of funding.

15  
16 Issue Number 98-YK-02

17  
18 2. The wanton waste issue was  
19 formally presented the Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory  
20 Council in the fall meeting of October 6 to 7, 1998 by the  
21 Refuge Manager of the Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge.  
22 the Yukon-Kuskokwim Regional Advisory Council moved for the  
23 Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge, State and AVCP to work  
24 together and implement an information and education program.  
25 The Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge has created  
26 "Information and Educational" material to bring out to the  
27 Traditional and IRA village of the Yukon-Kuskokwim Region as  
28 an educational tool. Coordinator Andrew has created one page  
29 "Respectful Practices in Hunting Caribou" to use as talking  
30 points. The Refuge Information Technicians will carry out  
31 the outreach program on wanton waste to the Region 5  
32 villages.

33  
34 Issue Number 98-YK-03

35  
36 3. Gaps in information about  
37 customary and traditional use for some Yukon-Kuskokwim  
38 communities. During the past two proposal cycles, a number  
39 of communities have been identified that staff does not have  
40 enough information on. These communities have not had formal  
41 Alaska Department of Fish and Game subsistence studies or  
42 other published studies. Staff depends on the studies to  
43 give details about the animals the communities are requesting  
44 customary and traditional use determinations for. The gaps  
45 have posed a problem in getting positive customary and  
46 traditional for the communities.

47  
48 Coordinator Andrew and anthropologist Pat McClenahan  
49 collected information from residents of Akiak, Akiachak,  
50 Hooper Bay, Scammon Bay, Chevak, Quinhagak, Eek, Napakiak,

00053

1 Tuntutuliak in 1997 and 1998. Under the current Fish and  
2 Wildlife Service Cooperative Agreement with the Alaska  
3 Department of Fish and Game, a more comprehensive study is  
4 underway for the community of Akiachak.

5  
6 Staff proposes to research a number of communities  
7 this year, with the consent and support of the communities.  
8 Communities still in need of research are Kipnuk, Chefnak,  
9 Nightmute, Toksook Bay, Tununak, and Newtok with respect to  
10 the subsistence use of large terrestrial mammals, especially  
11 caribou and bear. Mountain Village, St. Marys, Pitkas Point  
12 and Pilot Station and Marshall, with regard to the  
13 subsistence use and use areas for black bear. Akiak, in  
14 connection with the subsistence use of and uses areas for  
15 caribou and moose.

16  
17 Thank you again for this opportunity to  
18 submit our concerns to you. Sincerely.

19  
20 MR. J. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21  
22 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you. Do you have  
23 any questions or additional to this report, Council members?  
24 Do you have questions on this report?

25  
26 (No audible responses)

27  
28 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If you don't have -- the  
29 floor is open to accept or reject this report. If you don't  
30 have no questions, the floor is now open to accept the  
31 report.

32  
33 MR. NICOLAI: Mr. Chairman, to accept the  
34 1998 Annual Report. (In Yup'ik)

35  
36 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Ilarion moves to accept  
37 the 1998 Annual Report, is there any second?

38  
39 MR. HANSON: Second.

40  
41 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by John Hanson.  
42 Discussion?

43  
44 (No audible response)

45  
46 MR. THOMPSON: Question.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question has been called  
49 for, all in favor say aye.

50

00054

1 IN UNISON: Aye.

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Opposed same sign.

4

5 (No opposing responses)

6

7 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Motion carried. Annual  
8 Report, 1999 [sic] is accepted.

9

10 Next on our agenda, new business, nine, proposals to  
11 change Federal subsistence regulations on taking of wildlife  
12 on Federal public land. You'll find this under Tab H. Who  
13 going to take care of this? Sue?

14

15 MS. DETWILER: Thank you. Mr. Chair, the two primary  
16 presenter, Dave Fisher and Pat McClenahan aren't here because  
17 they're sick. And we had hoped to get at least Pat  
18 McClenahan on phone by teleconference by 3:00, so one thing  
19 you might consider doing is holding off on at least her  
20 proposals until 3:00, in hopes that we can get a hold of her  
21 by then. There's a possibility that Dave Fisher, who was  
22 supposed to do the other proposals may also be on line, but  
23 that is probably not as likely because he has got a pretty  
24 bad back right now.

25

26 I'm prepared to give you an overview of the proposals  
27 that Dave Fisher worked on, I can sort of highlight the  
28 issues and then you can carry it from there as a Council, so  
29 if you wanted to proceed with the proposals we could start  
30 out with Dave's and that might take us until at least 3:00,  
31 at which time we might be able to hook into Anchorage.

32

33 Another option would be to have the agency reports  
34 from whatever agencies are represented here in the room, you  
35 can just skip the proposal part of the agenda until 3:00 and  
36 then have agency reports.

37

38 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay, thank you.

39

40 I don't know, it seems to me that every time whenever  
41 we have a meeting in a village, like this, we always have  
42 some kind of problem because the people that are supposed to  
43 be out there never -- sometime never attend.

44

45 I think we try to continue with items on the agenda.  
46 This item E, we hold that off or what? Item E is change  
47 subsistence regulations to take wildlife resources. We going  
48 to hold that off or -- does anyone know?

49

50 MS. DETWILER: If you'd like to hold off on

00055

1 that until 3:00, we can at least get Pat McClenahan on the  
2 phone, and maybe Dave Fisher, and then if you don't do that  
3 now, you can go directly to some of the other agenda items  
4 that don't require Pat and Dave.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. Next we go down to  
7 presentation of procedures in each proposal. That one there,  
8 we hold off that too?

9  
10 MS. DETWILER: Is your intent to go into the  
11 proposals now or.....

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: No, my planning is just  
14 to go down -- change this one to six, it seems to me we got  
15 some people here who could be -- present these. Presentation  
16 procedure for each proposal, they be presenting introduction  
17 and proposal analysis, that someone -- you could take that or  
18 we could wait until the teleconference or what?

19  
20 MS. DETWILER: It might be better to wait  
21 until the teleconference because the person who do the  
22 presenting would be Dave or Pat and they give you a fuller  
23 presentation.

24  
25 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Uh-huh. Okay. How about  
26 Item 2, Department of Fish and Game comments?

27  
28 MR. J. ANDREW: (In Yup'ik)

29  
30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay. It look like from  
31 A or B, we have to wait until teleconference all the way to  
32 proposal 99-40 and then we go into new business, B, Regional  
33 Council application procedure (Andrew).

34  
35 MR. J. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
36 John Andrew for Y-K Council. (In Yup'ik)

37  
38 INTERPRETER NICK: Every year some of the  
39 Council seats are up for reelection or election. Anyone who  
40 wishes to apply to be considered to be a Regional Council  
41 member they have opportunity to be considered by filling out  
42 an application. The Board is accepting applications through  
43 March 1994 [sic]. Membership one 10 Federal Subsistence  
44 Regional Advisory Councils. The Regional Councils provide  
45 advice and recommendations to the Board concerning  
46 subsistence hunting, trapping and fishing issues on Federal  
47 public lands. Thirty-five appointments will be made in 1999  
48 to fill expiring terms on the Regional Councils.

49  
50 The Regional Councils are the crucial link between

00056

1 subsistence users and the Federal Subsistence Board as their  
2 recommendations carry a great deal of weight in decisions  
3 regarding subsistence, says Mitch Demientieff, Chair of the  
4 Board.

5  
6 There are 10 Regional Advisory Councils.

7  
8 Criteria for membership:

9  
10 A Regional Council member must be a resident  
11 of the region he/she wishes to represent; knowledgeable of  
12 local and regional subsistence uses of fish and wildlife  
13 resources; willing to travel to and attend Regional Council  
14 meetings at least two times each year (usually in October and  
15 February); willing to attend Federal Subsistence Board  
16 meetings on occasion.

17  
18 Federal Subsistence Regions:

19  
20 Regional Advisory Councils represent the following  
21 geographic regions in Alaska:

22  
23 Region 1, Southeast; Region 2, Southcentral; Region  
24 3, Kodiak/Aleutians; Region 4, Bristol Bay; Region 4, Yukon-  
25 Kuskokwim Delta; Region 6, Western Interior; Region 7, Seward  
26 Peninsula; Region 8, Northwest Arctic; Region 9, Eastern  
27 Interior; Region 10, North Slope.

28  
29 Regional Council and Alternate members are  
30 appointed to three-year terms. The Regional Councils meet at  
31 least twice a each year with members and alternates being  
32 reimbursed for business-related expenses. Additional  
33 Responsibilities of the Regional Councils include:

34  
35 Review and make recommendations to  
36 the Federal Subsistence Board on proposals for regulations,  
37 policies, management plans and other subsistence related  
38 issues on Federal public lands;

39  
40 Develop proposals pertaining to the  
41 subsistence harvest of fish and wildlife, and review  
42 proposals submitted by others;

43  
44 Encourage and promote local  
45 participation in the decision-making process affecting  
46 subsistence harvests on Federal public lands;

47  
48 Make recommendations on customary and  
49 traditional use determinations of subsistence resources;

50



00057

1                               Make recommendations on rural status  
2 determinations;

3  
4                               Appoint members to National Park  
5 Subsistence Resource Commissions.

6  
7                               For more information please call in the  
8 Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta, John Andrew at 800-621-5804 or 907-  
9 543-3151.

10  
11                              In Region 5, Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta, Fritz  
12 George, Willard, Robert Nick -- I got confused on that part,  
13 so I'm not going to interpret that.

14  
15                              CHAIRMAN H. WILDE:   (In Yup'ik)

16  
17                              INTERPRETER NICK:   The Chair advises that  
18 he's going to -- or rather John Andrew reported which of the  
19 Regional Council members terms are going to be up. And he  
20 also mentioned that there's going to be a hook up for a  
21 teleconference.

22  
23                              MR. WILD:   I got Pat on the phone, I got Pete  
24 DeMatteo.

25  
26                              MS. McCLENAHAN:   Is George there?

27  
28                              MR. WILD:   Vince, is George there?

29  
30                              MR. MATHEWS:   Yes, he is.

31  
32                              MR. WILD:   George is there. I believe Greg  
33 Boz is on the phone.

34  
35                              MS. McCLENAHAN:   Yes, he's here.

36  
37                              MR. WILD:   Okay, have a good conference.

38  
39                              MS. McCLENAHAN:   Okay.

40  
41                              MS. DETWILER:   Hi, Anchorage office, this is  
42 Sue. The Council is in a meeting right now and I'm just  
43 making arrangements here to hook up this conference set up,  
44 so have a little patience for a minute.

45  
46                              MS. McCLENAHAN:   Okay. We'll stand-by, Sue.  
47 Oh, Sue.

48  
49                              MS. DETWILER:   Yes.

50

00058

1 MS. McCLENAHAN: I have Pete DeMatteo here  
2 and he can present 42B.

3  
4 MS. DETWILER: Okay.

5  
6 (Off record comments - moving microphones, etc for  
7 conference call)

8  
9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Pat, you on?

10  
11 MS. McCLENAHAN: Hello, Harry.

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, there's some  
14 questions that not answered, especially -- we start out with  
15 you on our agenda, old business, on D, update on cooperative  
16 agreement. You want to go over that a little bit so Council  
17 will understand some?

18  
19 MS. McCLENAHAN: Which one you referring to?  
20 Tab B?

21  
22 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: D, it's on D.

23  
24 MS. McCLENAHAN: Okay, hold on a second.

25  
26 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Update on cooperative  
27 agreements.

28  
29 MS. McCLENAHAN: Okay. I don't have that,  
30 but here's where we are with cooperative agreements. I had a  
31 meeting with Michelle Sparcks from AVCP about two months ago,  
32 we talked about the possibility of AVCP sending something to  
33 us, you know, some proposal for future cooperative  
34 agreements. That has not developed any further yet, we're  
35 looking forward to talking to them again soon.

36  
37 The other cooperative agreement is with ADF&G  
38 cooperative agreement in which we are working with Mike  
39 Coffing to prepare a study for the community of Akiachak on  
40 their use of large mammals. And I think Mike -- if Mike  
41 Coffing is there at the meeting he will probably have a  
42 report for you about the progress of that study.

43  
44 And that's all I have on cooperative agreements right  
45 now.

46  
47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Mike.

48  
49 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Council, thank  
50 you. Recently we received the signed cooperative agreement

00059

1 between Fish and Wildlife Service and the Department of Fish  
2 and Game. And as Pat mentioned, one component of that does  
3 include a subsistence study for the community of Akiachak.  
4 And that study -- right now I'm in the process of developing  
5 a survey that we will be using in that study. I've talked  
6 with Fritz a few times on the phone.

7  
8 Fritz has worked with some folks here at the Council  
9 to identify some knowledgeable elders that I can interview  
10 about custom and traditional uses and traditional land use  
11 areas up there.

12  
13 So what we plan to do this spring and much of it will  
14 take place in March and April, we'll be going up to Akiachak  
15 and we'll be hiring some local assistants to help conduct the  
16 household surveys. We'll have an interpreter and we will,  
17 essentially, do a baseline study similar to -- similar, but  
18 not exactly like it, similar to the study that Kwethluk had  
19 done for it back in 1986. Many of the proposals that you've  
20 dealt with in the past have reference to Kwethluk work and so  
21 we're look at identifying subsistence use areas. We're going  
22 to gather harvest information, more information on customary  
23 and traditional use of resources by the community of  
24 Akiachak.

25  
26 And we hope to have most of that survey work done  
27 this spring, the data analysis over the summer, the write-up  
28 in the fall so that the Council has that information in final  
29 form to use next winter during your proposal deliberation.

30 So that's the update that I have for you. Thank you.

31  
32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. Any  
33 questions for Mike?

34  
35 (No audible responses)

36  
37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you.

38  
39 Next on our agenda is update C&T Working Group  
40 recommendations. Pat.

41  
42 (Pause)

43  
44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Pat, you there?

45  
46 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes, I'm here. Hold on just  
47 a second. Should be under Tab G. Very briefly Tab G has a  
48 report of the C&T Working Group, basically a two-page  
49 overview of the issues and recommendations that were covered  
50 in the last meeting.

00060

1           As you know the C&T Working Group was established by  
2 the Board last May to talk about questions that the Councils  
3 had about the C&T process. And the members of the Working  
4 Group are Dan O'Hara, Craig Fleener, Bill Thomas, Ida  
5 Hildebrand, Sandy Rabinowitch, Keith Goltz and Ken Thompson.

6           The working group met three times and the last  
7 meeting was in November and it met to consider the Councils'  
8 recommendations, that is all of the Councils recommendations,  
9 on C&T. And we were able to pull out areas of concern that  
10 were expressed by the Councils.

11  
12           The first issue is about the importance of using  
13 traditional knowledge and a need to formally recognize the  
14 role that it plays in the specific Regional Advisory Council  
15 and the Federal Subsistence Board process. The point was  
16 emphasized many times by the Councils and within the working  
17 group. Some traditional knowledge is being used by this  
18 program, both through the recommendations from the Councils  
19 and in the proposal analyses that was developed, especially  
20 those analyses that we've been working on the last couple of  
21 years. Still the Councils and the working group members  
22 clearly requested and recommended a full recognition of the  
23 importance of traditional knowledge.

24  
25           The second issue has to do with multiple species  
26 analyses. This topic came up in a variety of ways. It's an  
27 issue on which not all of the Councils agree. One example of  
28 the concerns addressed is since most of the information that  
29 staff gathers for the Councils are for moose and caribou an  
30 bear is the same, it tends to be repetitive, why can't staff  
31 do one analysis for all species at once, was the question  
32 that some people have. When subsistence hunters are  
33 hunting, they take whatever is available, this is a  
34 subsistence lifestyle.

35  
36           Customary and traditional use determinations have  
37 been made for moose species now in most communities.  
38 However, some cases still exists where a community is making  
39 a request for many species for the same area. In this case,  
40 we're proposing a combined analysis. This recommendation can  
41 be accommodated within our existing process that we're using  
42 now. There is not need to change it formally.

43  
44           Some examples for this year or this type of analysis  
45 can be found in Region 2's crossover Proposals 99-5 and 99-6,  
46 99-7, 99-8 and so forth. And in Region 3's Proposal  
47 99-29.

48  
49           The third issue that we have is differences between  
50 regions. This refers to differences in how customary and

00061

1 traditional use determinations are done between the different  
2 regions. It was identified as a potential problem for  
3 Councils when dealing with these overlap proposals that we've  
4 been dealing with for the last several years.

5  
6 One example is the difference between the analytic  
7 standard that Bristol Bay Council asks of C&T use analyses,  
8 that is they like to see some published data. Other Councils  
9 may put greater dependence the testimony of elders and  
10 hunters. Another example is the desire by some Councils to  
11 establish customary and traditional use determinations for  
12 all species by unit, while other Councils prefer to retain  
13 the least restrictive determinations, all rural residents,  
14 and you'll see that today in Proposal 43, as an example with  
15 some of the comments that other Councils have been making on  
16 that particular proposal.

17  
18 Differences between regions already are being  
19 addressed within the existing process, because the amount of  
20 information for any one factor varies a great deal, both  
21 between regions and between proposal analyses. Before any  
22 changes in the process are made, proposers of change should  
23 be aware of this issue.

24  
25 And so to recommendations. Nine out of 10 Councils  
26 clearly recommended keeping C&T determinations as part of the  
27 regulatory process. Four Councils voted that the process for  
28 doing C&T be developed by the Councils.

29  
30 And so that brings us to what might come next. The  
31 findings of the C&T Working Group don't require changes in  
32 any of the regulations that currently exist. However, some  
33 additional guidance may be needed to provide direction to  
34 staff and Councils on some of the variations desired between  
35 Councils. For example, species-by-species versus an all  
36 species approach.

37  
38 Given the legal opinions requested by the Board on  
39 certain aspects of the C&T process, Chairman Mitch  
40 Demientieff requested that this overview of the committee  
41 recommendations be provided to each Council. The Board will  
42 take these recommendations up at an undetermined time in the  
43 future. In the meantime, the Subsistence Program will  
44 continue operating under the current C&T process as outlined  
45 in our regulations, with a plan for resolution of any  
46 remaining issues prior to next fall as we begin the new  
47 regulatory cycle and assume the responsibility for fisheries.

48  
49 Mr. Chairman, that concludes my report.

50

00062

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Pat.

2

3 We're going to go into Item 9, new business, A,  
4 proposals to change Federal subsistence regulations on taking  
5 of wildlife on Federal public land. You'll find this under  
6 Tab H.

7

8 Presentation procedure for each proposal that we look  
9 at. One introductions of proposal/analysis, lead. And second  
10 -- here's how the proposal will work. Second, Department of  
11 Fish and Game comments. Third, other agencies/Eastern  
12 Interior Regional Council recommendation on overlap  
13 proposals. Four, summary of written public comments by  
14 Andrew. And, five, public testimony. And then six, Regional  
15 Council deliberations and recommendation and justification.

16

17 MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman, John Andrew,  
18 Coordinator. (In Yup'ik)

19

20 INTERPRETER NICK: John is interpreting  
21 again. New business, Item A.

22

23 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, guyana. Now, we'll  
24 go into the following stand-alone proposals, affects only in  
25 Yukon-Kuskokwim Region. We getting proposals now, Proposal  
26 99-41, regulatory proposal for beavers in Unit 18, to change  
27 the seasons and bag limit. Dave Fisher. Who will take his  
28 part here?

29

30 MR. J. ANDREW: Steve Kovach.

31

32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah.

33

34 MS. McCLENAHAN: Mr. Chairman.

35

36 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, go ahead.

37

38 MS. McCLENAHAN: Dave Fisher is not with us  
39 today, he's ill. Can Sue Detwiler present the (indiscernible  
40 - phone)

41

42 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, okay, we recognize  
43 you to go ahead then.

44

45 MR. KOVACH: Good afternoon, Mr. Chair, my  
46 name is Steve Kovach, I'm the wildlife biologist for mammals  
47 on the Yukon Delta National Wildlife Refuge. I'm kind of  
48 getting here at the last minute and I apologize for my  
49 lateness, but we were trying to finish up some work on moose  
50 here.

00063

1 I'm going to stand in for Dave on this proposal and  
2 another one that I worked with him on, so I'm somewhat  
3 familiar with the information. Mike Coffing, who also worked  
4 on this proposal will jump in and help me as needed.

5  
6 Proposal 41 was submitted by the Emmonak Tribal  
7 Council. Their proposal covered several aspects, four main  
8 topics. First, it would expand the existing beaver trapping  
9 season in Unit 18 from November 1st to June 10 to a year-  
10 round season. Second, it will allow beaver to be taken with  
11 a firearm at any time, but it would prohibit the take of  
12 beaver with snares or traps from June 11 through October  
13 31st, which is the current closed trapping season for  
14 beavers.

15  
16 It would change the ceiling requirement for beaver  
17 that only those hides that would be sold or commercially  
18 tanned be sealed by representatives of the Alaska Department  
19 of Fish and Game versus the current requirement, which  
20 requires that all beaver be sealed. And lastly it would  
21 establish a hunting season for beaver, no closed season, with  
22 a limit of 50.

23  
24 Currently beaver may be taken with a firearm, using a  
25 trapping license in Unit 18 for the period of April 1st  
26 through June 10th, and this exists in both the Federal  
27 subsistence regulations, as well as the State regulation.

28  
29 Currently there's no customary and traditional use  
30 determination for beaver in Unit 18, therefore, any Federally  
31 qualified rural resident is eligible to beaver from Federal  
32 public lands in Unit 18.

33  
34 Historically, beaver have been very important in this  
35 area for both clothing as well as food sources. Our past  
36 studies have shown that as few as 25 percent of the beaver  
37 harvested are actually reported taken through the sealing  
38 process. Most beaver are harvested through the November,  
39 December and January time period, however, there is a harvest  
40 of beaver that occur throughout the rest of the year.

41  
42 Beaver populations in Unit 18 are very healthy, they  
43 are expanding. We at the refuge and the Department of Fish  
44 and Game receive numerous reports of beavers in areas where  
45 they have not been seen before or have not been seen for a  
46 good many years, so the populations throughout the Delta is  
47 very healthy, it can easily withstand an increase in harvest.

48  
49 Historically our harvests of beaver were much higher  
50 than what they have -- than what they are currently. If you

00064

1 look on page nine of the analysis, Table one there, it kind  
2 of give a kind of historical perspective, 25 years or so of  
3 those beavers that were sealed in the unit, this is by all  
4 means not all the beavers that were harvested in the -- well,  
5 you can see in the latter part of the '70s in excess of 4,000  
6 beavers were being taken on an annual basis. Currently it's  
7 well less than 1,000.

8  
9 A lot of this decline is due to just a drop off in  
10 the interest of the harvesting beavers, reduced fur prices  
11 and so on. And certainly not a reflection of the population.

12  
13 What this proposal would do, if passed, is that it  
14 would create two different sets of harvest regulations for  
15 beavers in Unit 18. Currently the State regulations and the  
16 Federal regulations are perfectly aligned, they say the exact  
17 same thing. What this regulation would do is allow much more  
18 liberal taking of beaver for customary and traditional uses  
19 on Federal public lands. But as you well know, Federal  
20 public lands, especially in the lower end of the Yukon Delta  
21 here, are quite limited. Selected and conveyed lands are not  
22 included under the Federal program. Also all water between  
23 mean and high water is considered State land at this time.

24  
25 We have asked the Solicitor for information when and  
26 if the Federal Subsistence Board does take over fisheries in  
27 Federal waters, does that also extend to such things as  
28 beaver, like addressed in this proposal? We have not gotten  
29 a clear reading on that, but currently the indication is, no,  
30 it would not include things like beaver and mink and muskrat  
31 in waters that are currently controlled by the State.

32  
33 So this proposal would cause some difficulty for  
34 trappers and hunters in trying to figure out where they would  
35 be legal in harvesting these animals in under Federal  
36 regulations versus where they are regulated under State  
37 regulations.

38  
39 Right now, the preliminary conclusion from the  
40 subsistence staff is to defer this proposal until the Alaska  
41 Board of Game can act on a similar proposal. There is a  
42 movement within the Alaska Department of Fish and Game to  
43 restructure many of the furbearer regulations and make them  
44 much simpler than what they currently are.

45  
46 Unit 18 comes up before the Board of Game this coming  
47 fall, all regulations pertaining to animal -- to wildlife in  
48 Unit 18 will be addressed by the Board, big game, as well as  
49 furbearer regulations. Because of the confusion that this  
50 proposal may cause and the fact that the Board of Game will



00065

1 be meeting his fall and the opportunity presents itself to  
2 create a parallel proposal at that time, that is the  
3 rationale behind why the staff conclusion says to defer this  
4 proposal at this time.

5  
6 And that's all I have, Mr. Chair.

7  
8 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay, thank you. Alaska  
9 Department of Fish and Game comment to this proposal.

10  
11 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chair and Council, thank  
12 you. This proposal is something that the Department of Fish  
13 and Game has been involved in with Emmonak, along with the  
14 Yukon Delta Refuge and the Office of Subsistence Management  
15 in developing it. Our Bethel office, myself and Roger  
16 Seavoy, were both in discussion with Emmonak Tribal Council  
17 as they were drafting this up.

18  
19 As Steve has mentioned, the State does have some  
20 concern, and the concern comes from the fact that if the  
21 Federal Board adopts this regulation or this proposal as a  
22 regulation this spring, it will have essentially two  
23 different season, bag limits and different restrictions on  
24 beaver in Unit 18. And I think what we're interested in  
25 doing here is having regulations that are consistently  
26 applied across land so that a person that may be in the  
27 water, harvesting beaver in the water, won't have to worry  
28 whether they're in Federal water or State water, but will be  
29 able to abide by the regulations without unintentionally  
30 breaking the law.

31  
32 So, for that reason, what we're -- what the State  
33 does support is a more liberal trapping season for beaver in  
34 Unit 18, including the take of beaver by firearms. Many of  
35 the provision, such as restrictions of taking beaver by traps  
36 or snares during the period of July 11 through October 31st,  
37 we support that.

38  
39 We have some concerns about eliminating the sealing  
40 requirement at this time and recommend that, again, this be  
41 deferred until the State can look at beaver trapping  
42 regulations, not just for Unit 18, but for other units. Look  
43 at it as more of a statewide regulation.

44  
45 So I guess that sums it up. We would suggest --  
46 although we support parts of it, we suggest deferring it at  
47 this time.

48  
49 Thank you.

50

00066

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. Is  
2 there any other agency comment of this proposal, Proposal 41?

3  
4 (No audible responses)

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Go ahead, Billy.

7  
8 MR. McCANN: Yeah. I'd like to have  
9 (indiscernible). Right now, to me, we should make another  
10 proposal towards the beaver because a lot of people are from  
11 where the whitefish are, they're competing really bad. No  
12 more whitefish and one guy told me that in Johns River,  
13 someplace, he see a lot -- in the summertime a lot of  
14 whitefish from beyond the dam, beaver dam, lots of whitefish  
15 and he opened the dam and before he even opened the dam he  
16 set his net beyond it and he filled up his boat. The fish  
17 planned to go out, no place to go out, so we should do  
18 something about that.

19  
20 Mean rivers where the whitefish are to open it  
21 someday, like one time I said -- somebody said that the  
22 beaver are pretty smart and I said we make them learn someday  
23 maybe dams with dynamite, blow them up on the main river, so  
24 the whitefish will go back and forth. That's what -- I like  
25 that proposal with no limit to hunt. I mean, no closed  
26 season. I like that, but I think it would be pretty slow.  
27 Even the way to protect the beavers and we should protect  
28 them, also whitefish the people want to eat. We should look  
29 into that sometime or put it on the agenda next meeting or  
30 something to what we come up with, Fish and Game and Fish and  
31 Wildlife. They should look into that because I think it  
32 important.

33  
34 Thank you.

35  
36 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Bill. At this  
37 time I would like to ask our coordinator if there is any  
38 written public comments to this certain proposal?

39  
40 MR. J. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman, there are no  
41 written public comments on Proposal 41.

42  
43 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Is there any public  
44 testimony towards this proposal? Tim Andrew.

45  
46 MR. T. ANDREW: Can I just address you from  
47 here?

48  
49 COURT REPORTER: No. I'll answer that, no.

50

1 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
2 AVCP position on this one here, since it is sponsored by the  
3 Native Village of Emmonak, we tend to support this proposed  
4 regulation. We have heard, through my department, a number  
5 of concerns, like Mr. McCann said, about the amount of beaver  
6 that's blocking up some of the streams that -- essential  
7 streams that whitefish kind of spawn in or where they live,  
8 whitefish habitat. Whitefish is a very important food specie  
9 for the many of the people in the Unit 18 area, AVCP area,  
10 and there is so many beaver out there that I think even with  
11 the liberal hunting season, also without the restriction of  
12 the requir -- without the restriction or requirement of the  
13 beaver hides to be sealed, I don't think it will make that  
14 much of an impact on beaver population.

15  
16 There is just so many where people have never seen  
17 beaver before where they're popping up all over the place.  
18 You know, around Hooper Bay, Chevak, Scammon area, there was  
19 virtually no beaver out there in years past, but now there's  
20 huge populations. And, in fact, some people from that area,  
21 also expressed a lot of concern about the beaver damming up  
22 some of the streams and causing some die-offs of whitefish.

23  
24 And that pretty much concludes our position, thank  
25 you.

26  
27 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you. Again, to the  
28 public, if you want to have a testify, make sure that you  
29 fill out testifying forms on the table over there. This is  
30 for anyone the public listening here.

31  
32 Any more public testimony? Sue.

33  
34 MS. DETWILER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just  
35 for the benefit of your information, the Board needs a  
36 justification when you make the recommendation, so be sure  
37 and explain why you take the action that you do, so that they  
38 have something to look at when they determine what their  
39 decision is going to be.

40  
41 And as a second point, the Board is limited to making  
42 decisions just for taking for subsistence purposes, they  
43 don't want to take an action because it's going to have an  
44 influence on some other species, so even though your reason  
45 for extending the season is to improve habitat for whitefish,  
46 it's better to point out that taking beaver year around is  
47 consistent with your customary and traditional uses.

48  
49 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Sue.

00068

1 Is there any more public to testify here, to certain  
2 proposal?

3  
4 (No audible responses)

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If there's not, Regional  
7 Council deliberations is open now to recommendation or  
8 justification. To let you know on this proposal it's -- this  
9 certain proposal is on your Tab H, Proposal 41, if you go to  
10 Proposal 41, this was proposed by Emmonak Tribal Council.

11 You could see that the staff deferred this until  
12 Alaska Department Fish and Game take action on it. And also  
13 ADF&G opposed this certain thing.

14  
15 Now we're open to Council for what you want and how  
16 you want to handle this regulation 41. John.

17  
18 MR. THOMPSON: Yes, the beaver is the one  
19 that kind of ruined two species, that's whitefish and  
20 blackfish. And the blackfish is the diet of mink, otter and  
21 other species that lives in the water. Not only that, they  
22 dam up all the small streams which blackfish goes through,  
23 and that's the diet for mink and otter, wintertime. Not only  
24 human, also the game is affected by beaver.

25  
26 Thank you.

27  
28 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Anyone else on the  
29 Council?

30  
31 (No audible responses)

32  
33 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If it's not, Proposal  
34 99-41 now it's ready to open to the floor, accept it or  
35 reject it.

36  
37 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

38  
39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

40  
41 MR. L. WILDE: I'd like to move to defer this  
42 proposal until the Alaska Board of Game acts on a similar  
43 proposal.

44  
45 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion on the  
46 floor to defer regular Proposal 41 to Alaska Department Fish  
47 and Game Board, is there any second to the motion?

48  
49 MR. HANSON: Second.

50

00069

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by John Hanson.  
2 Discussion?

3  
4 MR. L. WILDE: The reason why my motion was  
5 to defer was because if we do pass and the Fish and Game --  
6 the Board of Game acts negatively on that proposal, we would  
7 be able to find out what points they agreed on and what  
8 points they disagreed on and give it a little bit more time  
9 for some of these concerns that staff has to be addressed.

10  
11 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion,  
12 Council? John Hanson.

13  
14 MR. HANSON: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
15 Yeah, I think it's best for the Board to just defer it until  
16 the Game Board acts and the Council here can see what the  
17 Game Board acted on. If they don't, then this Board can take  
18 it up again on their next fall meeting. Otherwise, like what  
19 Lester said, if we act on it now, we vote and it passes here,  
20 I don't know if it's going to go through the Regional  
21 Council, the main council, and if it doesn't then we'll just  
22 be voting on the negative side.

23  
24 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion on  
25 Council?

26  
27 MR. CHURCH: Mr. Chairman.

28  
29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Willard.

30  
31 MR. CHURCH: Mr. Chairman, if Fish and Game  
32 or Fish and Wildlife decides not to accept this proposal,  
33 could we, as an Advisory Council, also request justification  
34 on why it was not accepted, including OMB information?  
35 Because as I understand it, with any regulatory changes there  
36 needs to be a budget for those changes.

37  
38 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Do we have a response  
39 from.....

40  
41 MR. J. ANDREW: Sue.

42  
43 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Sue.

44  
45 MS. DETWILER: I wasn't sure if your question  
46 referred to whether if the State Board of Game rejects this  
47 proposal or if the Federal Subsistence Board rejects it.

48  
49 MR. CHURCH: Both.

50

00070

1 MS. DETWILER: We don't have any control over  
2 what the State Board of Game does. Hopefully they would let  
3 you know, at least in their record, why they rejected the  
4 proposal. If, however, the Federal Subsistence Board rejects  
5 a recommendation that you make, the Board will respond in  
6 writing explaining why they rejected your recommendation.  
7

8 MR. CHURCH: As I also understand, too, you  
9 know, the second part of the question was with regulatory  
10 changes with regards to subsistence, for instance, there is a  
11 cost, OMB, Officer of Management and Budget, and with those  
12 changes there's cost associated with that. I feel that, as  
13 an Advisory Council, we should be able to get access to that  
14 type of information as well, because we are in the process of  
15 looking over and reviewing proposals that are submitted from  
16 our community. And a lot of the times we have justification,  
17 being traditional subsistence hunters, trappers and users of  
18 our resource, but at the same time we should start becoming  
19 more informed of the other process that we very rarely have  
20 access to, and that's cost associated. And I think it's time  
21 that we become more involved in that as well, at least be  
22 briefed on the full process.  
23

24 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Sue. How  
25 about State? Will you respond to his question?  
26

27 MR. COFFING: Sure, Mr. Chairman and,  
28 Willard, I'm responding to one of the things I don't know  
29 much about, today I find.  
30

31 Willard, when the Board of Game meets and when the  
32 members discuss a proposal, generally before they vote on a  
33 proposal they express why they're going to vote the way the  
34 do, often, and so that the other members and the public and  
35 staff that are there have an understanding -- just as this  
36 Council is doing, why do you support something or what's in  
37 your mind and why you feel uncomfortable about supporting  
38 something. So that's generally made part of the public  
39 record, in fact, so you know not where the whole Board stands  
40 after they voted, but the individual members of the Board in  
41 most cases. So you will know that.  
42

43 As far as costs associated with regulations, when the  
44 State does enact regulations they -- and I don't know a lot  
45 about this, but I know that things that come across my desk,  
46 in terms of Board actions, usually attached with that is some  
47 explanation about the effect on the budget. Is it going to  
48 result in an increased cost to the Department or to the  
49 State, so I think there's an avenue for access to some of  
50 that information as well, regardless which way the proposal

00071

1 goes.

2

3 MR. CHURCH: And also one more comment. May  
4 be due to my lack of understanding of how that process works,  
5 but sometimes there may be, you know, justification on their  
6 part due to budget restraints and I don't feel that that  
7 should be looked at and accepted, especially when it does  
8 affect our need for this subsistence resource. That  
9 sometimes the subsistence resource should have the ability  
10 and power to override the budget that is required. That we --  
11 that should be the emphasis, the subsistence need and not  
12 the budget.

13

14 MR. COFFING: I understand that, Willard.  
15 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I mean I'm not a Board member, but  
16 my sense is that the Board looks genuinely at subsistence  
17 proposals, with in mind, are they doing what's right for the  
18 people and what's right for the resource out there. I guess  
19 I don't know of an instance where the Board has voted against  
20 a subsistence proposal because of cost, there may be some  
21 costs associated with some regulatory requirement related to  
22 a commercial fishing activity or something like that, that  
23 might call them to rethink that, but offhand I can't think of  
24 any instance where they might reject a subsistence proposal  
25 because of budget considerations.

26

27 MR. CHURCH: Thank you, Mike.

28

29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John.

30

31 MR. HANSON: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
32 Yeah, Mike, on this ADF&G comments that's written here, were  
33 you the individual at ADF&G that comment on it or was it  
34 somebody else?

35

36 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, John, I don't  
37 have my book in front of me. If you go to the back of the  
38 proposal analysis, after Justification, and the -- the  
39 Preliminary Conclusion and Justification, over on the right  
40 side you'll see the State's comments there. Those are the  
41 State's comments, kind of verbatim as we submitted them.

42

43 Now, one thing I want to make clear for the Council  
44 here, when we submitted State's comments our comments were on  
45 the original proposal that was submitted. So the comments  
46 that you see are what our comments are on the original  
47 proposal, not comments on the analysis, not comments on the  
48 justification or conclusion, but comment on the original  
49 proposal that was submitted. And that's the case for all of  
50 the State's comments there.

00072

1 Up to the front of the proposal there's kind of a  
2 grid that shows the Department's comments and you see  
3 "opposed" in there. Well, in none of the State's comments  
4 that we submitted did we use the word "oppose" so I think  
5 that was maybe an interpretation and, in fact, it's maybe the  
6 same thing, but what we had said in some instances is "do not  
7 support." And I think, as I mentioned on this one, there are  
8 parts of this that we do support because we worked very  
9 closely with Emmonak Tribal Council in working through the  
10 proposal, drafting the proposal up before it was submitted,  
11 so there are parts that we do support.

12  
13 I think the part that causes concern may be not Mike  
14 Coffing's concerns, may be not specific of Roger Seavoy's  
15 concerns, but Department concerns over a larger area. And  
16 the implications for subsistence hunting or maybe the impacts  
17 to hunters in causing confused regulations because we have  
18 different sets of regulations. The people that were above me  
19 were considering the greater picture of that. And I think  
20 they did that with interest of subsistence users trying to  
21 avoid an unintentional problems rather than keep people from  
22 using subsistence.

23  
24 MR. HANSON: Okay. The ADF&G comments, they  
25 oppose the proposed hunting regulations, but then down under  
26 they support extension of trapping seasons, use of firearms  
27 and restriction on use of traps and snares from June 11th to  
28 October 31. Now that doesn't give -- I went through it a  
29 couple of times and that doesn't give any idea of why they  
30 oppose it and then they support it.

31  
32 MR. COFFING: That's -- Mr, Chairman, if I  
33 may? That -- what I guess I would urge you to do is not read  
34 that grid, but go to the State's comments that are to the  
35 back of the proposal. Towards the end of the proposal, on  
36 the right hand page you'll see verbatim what the State's  
37 comments were.

38  
39 When I read that yesterday, I was, like you, I was  
40 kind of confused. I called Fairbanks and they looked in the  
41 booklet that the Western Regional Council had, this same  
42 proposal, and in that grid the comments were different. I'm  
43 scratching my head and then I look at the proposal that we  
44 submitted and they were a little different, so I fell back to  
45 using the original proposal comment that we submitted, like  
46 the 14th of January, and actually you do have that, it's at  
47 the tail end of proposal analysis on the right hand page in  
48 your booklets there.

49  
50 But, again, we support a more liberal trapping



00073

1 season, beaver are numerous. The part of the proposal that  
2 we have concern about is the fact that we're removing sealing  
3 requirement, we're talking about only Unit 18 and we're doing  
4 it -- from what I could see, we'd like to see more  
5 opportunity for public comment on liberalizing beaver season,  
6 putting less restrictions on beaver trapping and doing that  
7 in areas in addition to Unit 18, not only Unit 18. There are  
8 people in Unit 18 that go up into Unit 19. And this was  
9 adopted now you'll still have the old regulation in Unit 19  
10 where people hunt beaver when they hunt moose or caribou in  
11 the falltime. Or up in 21(E), for example, people up there.

12  
13 So I think what we're looking at doing is looking at  
14 a larger geographic area to apply this to and also work it  
15 into the Board of Game cycle, so that when you have the Board  
16 of Game adopt it and the Federal Board adopt it, then it  
17 doesn't matter whether you're in Federal waters or State  
18 waters if the regulations are consistent.

19  
20 MR. HANSON: So if the Board of Game do not  
21 pass this proposal, can this Regional Board -- Regional  
22 Advisory Council on their next fall meeting make a proposal  
23 concerning this just to protect the whitefish and blackfish  
24 that the people utilize for subsistence? Not just whitefish,  
25 there's three different kind of whitefish around here that  
26 they use for subsistence after the salmon season is closed,  
27 the salmon are already passed. Just to protect those, can  
28 this Advisory Board make a proposal to the Regional Council  
29 for the next fall -- if the Game Board don't act on it, if  
30 they just let it -- I know the -- I know how the Game Board  
31 works because I was on the Game Board, see? It's not just  
32 the justification that they work on. When they work on a  
33 proposal there's lot of people that go against the proposal,  
34 they're hammered from left to right and that's what they use.  
35 Very few of the Board members will stand up for it, but  
36 others they just go with the rest of the people that are  
37 hammering the Board members. So if it doesn't pass then I  
38 guess this Board can just go ahead and make another proposal  
39 of the same thing on their next fall meeting.

40  
41 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Hanson, if  
42 this Council and if the Federal Subsistence Board votes to  
43 defer this proposal, this proposal will stay alive, it won't  
44 die, it will stay alive and it'll automatically be on your  
45 next fall meeting agenda for this Council, it'll still be  
46 there.

47  
48 And I might also add that -- you know, the Board of  
49 Game make up now is different than it's ever been. There are  
50 several rural members on that Board from Kotzebue. We have a

00074

1 member in Bethel, in fact, who used to work for AVCP Natural  
2 Resources who's a Board of Game members. And those folks are  
3 real sensitive, those rural members are real sensitive to  
4 these kind of issues, because beaver issues aren't just  
5 issues for Unit 18, there are beaver everywhere and there are  
6 issues up in Northwest Alaska, as well as Interior blocking  
7 waters to fish passes and that sort of thing.

8  
9 We hear that kind of comment. So I think the Board  
10 of Game is receptive, you know, in terms of listening to the  
11 idea and I think what we need to do in the Department and in  
12 Fish and Wildlife and with Advisory Committees is help  
13 educate Board members where we need to and do the best we can  
14 at getting a proposal in front of them that works best for  
15 people in this region and, you know, closely aligned with  
16 what this Council wants from this proposal.

17  
18 But the proposal will still be here, it won't go  
19 away, it'll be here next fall.

20  
21 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Billy.

22  
23 MR. McCANN: (In Yup'ik)

24  
25 MR. HUNT: Billy wanted to comment in Yup'ik.  
26 He said that what he was explaining is to what -- how it was  
27 explained, but this Regional Council members are Yup'ik  
28 people and some of the Fish and Wildlife staff are non-  
29 Natives and because non-Native people cannot truly recognize  
30 the importance of subsistence needs. He said that he  
31 recognized that -- he said that -- he's stating that the  
32 staff want Regional Council's assistance in making important  
33 decisions to adopt proposed regulations.

34  
35 He said that proposals that are submitted from the  
36 villages they know what they're asking for, but the staff  
37 want to know more and more about what -- the reasons why  
38 justification are needed to push through the proposed  
39 regulations. There seems to be some barrier between Natives  
40 and non-Natives that do not listen to the Native advisors as  
41 to how to address (indiscernible).

42  
43 MR. McCANN: We ought to help with them.  
44 We're trying to help the best we can. But it seems like  
45 there's little bit (indiscernible) not listen to use. We  
46 should know better than them because we live here for our  
47 life. We got experience of land. We got experience of fish.  
48 We got experience of all animals in the land and they don't  
49 have as much as we do, because they come from State Outside  
50 and they learn by the book and we not, we learn by taking,

00075

1 handling it, eating it. That's why if they want help they  
2 should at least listen to us.

3  
4 If we ask for a proposal, if they don't act on it,  
5 they should tell us why. Not us asking from some, what do we  
6 do with that proposal. They should let us know what's  
7 happened, what reason they don't act on it. Too many things,  
8 Fish and Game, Fish and Wildlife, they have -- if they all  
9 different jobs, one has to do it and one cannot do it, right?  
10 That's why they both should help us and we should help them.  
11 We should work together. Work together means doing you and  
12 I, listening to each other and find out each other, not deny  
13 him and accepting the proposal, especially proposal that we  
14 want ask for what we want. They should let us know why you  
15 don't act on it and maybe we can (indiscernible) again.  
16 Maybe, I'm wrong.

17  
18 Thank you.

19  
20 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion.  
21 John.

22  
23 MR. THOMPSON: Yes. The game what we're  
24 talking about is not like international waters or certain  
25 areas, it's local. They don't move around, they may drift to  
26 another place. Following year, depending on their feed and  
27 the population will grow if it wants to. That's what we're  
28 here for. We want to advise the Game Board because we know  
29 our area, we live, we survive from it. Like I say, whitefish  
30 and blackfish are destroyed by beaver. It's not only the  
31 whitefish and blackfish, it's also for the other games that  
32 feed from blackfish, those are declining because their  
33 livelihood is destroyed by beaver. And that's clear enough.

34  
35 And even thought you say about the financial, it  
36 doesn't need no financial. All you got to do is watch or get  
37 advice from us. If it needs to be controlled then we can  
38 control it.

39  
40 Like moose, look at what's happened when they make a  
41 moratorium, these people themselves, look at all the mooses  
42 [sic] around here. We try to help but we don't be listened.

43  
44 Thank you.

45  
46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion?

47  
48 (No audible responses)

49  
50 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If none, we're ready for

00076

1 action. Proposal 41. Motion is and a second, defer this  
2 proposal until the Alaska Department of Fish and Game [sic]  
3 act on a similar proposal. Now the floor is open for  
4 accepted or rejected. Request for roll call.

5  
6 MR. L. WILDE: Harry, it was not Alaska  
7 Department of Fish and Game, it was the Game Board.

8  
9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, Game Board. Open  
10 for roll call. I'll ask our secretary.

11  
12 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

13  
14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

15  
16 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion.

17  
18 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

19  
20 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

21  
22 MR. McCANN: Yes.

23  
24 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

25  
26 (No response)

27  
28 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

29  
30 MR. HANSON: Yeah.

31  
32 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

33  
34 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

35  
36 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

37  
38 (No response)

39  
40 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

41  
42 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

43  
44 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

45  
46 (No response)

47  
48 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

49  
50 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

00077

1 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson.

2  
3 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

4  
5 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yeas, three  
6 excused.

7  
8 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Motion carried. Now  
9 motion is accepted that deferred this proposal to the Alaska  
10 Department of Fish and Game [sic] on a similar proposal.

11  
12 Next on our agenda is the following proposal overlap  
13 with the Western Interior Region. Proposal 99-42, C&T for  
14 moose in 19(B) for residents of Quinhagak and rural residents  
15 of Unit 18. Pat.

16  
17 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Proposal  
18 42 has two parts. I will cover Proposal 42A, which is the  
19 C&T portion, and if you would like, I have Pete DeMatteo, the  
20 author of the 42B analysis here with me and he'd be glad to  
21 present that part to you.

22  
23 Let me go ahead with 42A.

24  
25 MR. MATHEWS: Pat?

26  
27 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes.

28  
29 MR. MATHEWS: How do we want to handle this --  
30 this is Vince Mathews, Regional Coordinator for the Western  
31 Interior. Good afternoon, Chairman Wilde. How would we want  
32 to handle the teleconference with the Chair of Western  
33 Interior, Carl Morgan, which is scheduled for tomorrow at  
34 10:15 on this proposal?

35  
36 MR. J. ANDREW: Pete [sic], can you hear me?  
37 Get closer to the mike, we can barely hear you.

38  
39 COURT REPORTER: That was Vince.

40  
41 MS. McCLENAHAN: Vince, can you hear John?

42  
43 MR. MATHEWS: Yes, I can hear John. John,  
44 can you hear me?

45  
46 MR. J. ANDREW: You are very hard to hear.

47  
48 MR. MATHEWS: Okay, I'll repeat again. We've  
49 been negotiating with the Chair of Western Interior to have a  
50 teleconference on Proposal 42, we have it set up tomorrow for

00078

1 March 3rd, at 10:15. How do we want to incorporate that with  
2 the discussion of 42?

3

4 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: So you want to delay this  
5 until tomorrow morning?

6

7 MR. MATHEWS: That would be one way to do it,  
8 but Chairman Morgan's time tomorrow is quite limited, from  
9 10:15 until about 10:55 at the latest.

10

11 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay, we'll try that. So  
12 we'll delay this until tomorrow morning, Proposal 42,  
13 however, we'll take the next one, 43. Proposal 43, black  
14 bear, establish C&T to residents of 21 and 23, Tanana,  
15 Russian Mission and others. Pat.

16

17 MS. McCLENAHAN: Mr. Chairman, Proposal 43  
18 was to establish a customary and traditional use  
19 determination for black bear in those units that you just  
20 mention, 21 and 23 and others. The proposal mentions  
21 including the residents of Units 21, 23, Tanana, Russian  
22 Mission and others. This was proposed by the Middle Yukon  
23 Fish and Game Advisory Committee and the Interior Regional  
24 Fish and Game Council. This is a backlog proposal that was  
25 deferred in 1998.

26

27 Currently there is no customary and traditional use  
28 determination for black bear in Unit 21 and so now all rural  
29 residents aren't eligible to subsistence hunt this resource  
30 under Federal subsistence regulations. The State and Federal  
31 hunting regulations for the unit allow a harvest of three  
32 bears annually with no closed season.

33

34 Proposal 43 was presented to the Councils and the  
35 Board last year as Proposal 98-69. Western Interior Council  
36 said they were concerned about making a customary and  
37 traditional use determination for such an abundant resource  
38 as black bear. Right now the existing all rural residents is  
39 the least restrictive. And there currently is not evidence  
40 of a biological or subsistence reason to restrict the  
41 harvest. For that reason the Western Interior Council  
42 opposed the proposal last year.

43

44 The Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta Regional Council deferred  
45 action on the proposal. The Eastern Interior and Northwest  
46 Arctic supported the proposal with modifications. And  
47 finally, back here, the Federal Subsistence Board deferred  
48 action on the proposal.

49

50 Mr. Chairman, I'm going to -- we got most of the

00079

1 information from Unit 18 and if there are questions we have  
2 on the line the author of this analysis who can help out if  
3 there questions from Unit 21 or 22 -- 23, I'm sorry, about  
4 this.

5  
6 For the residents of Unit 18 black bears are one of  
7 the large land animals that are an important secondary  
8 resource when they're available. The subsistence data used  
9 by Yukon-Kuskokwim residents was they take a variety of  
10 resources. Unit 18 community of Russian Mission has an  
11 established customary and traditional use finding for moose  
12 in Unit 21(E). Harvest records show a small, but consistent  
13 moose kill in Unit 21(E) by Russian Mission residents between  
14 1985 and the present.

15  
16 It is customary to subsistence hunt black bear while  
17 moose hunting for most of the Yukon-Kuskokwim residents who  
18 have black bear available. However, hunters are not required  
19 to report black bear harvest for Unit 21. Little information  
20 on the use of black bear in Unit 21 by the residents of Unit  
21 18 is available.

22  
23 The staff's preliminary conclusion on this proposal  
24 are to support the proposal with modification, recommending  
25 that the customary and traditional black bear determination  
26 for Unit 21 should read, and you have this in front of you on  
27 Page 51. Black bear, Unit 21(A), rural residents of Unit 21,  
28 Aniak, Crooked Creek, McGrath, Takotna. Unit 21(B), rural  
29 residents of Unit 21 and Tanana. Unit 21(C), rural residents  
30 of Unit 21, Tanana and Huslia. Unit 21(D), rural residents  
31 of Unit 21, Deering, Candle, Buckland, Selawick, Huslia and  
32 Tanana. And for Unit 21(E), rural residents of Unit 21 and  
33 Russian Mission.

34  
35 There may be other communities on the Middle Yukon  
36 River in Unit 18 that do take black bear in Unit 21 and that  
37 would remain for staff to research this coming year, unless  
38 there are people at the meeting who can add to this analysis.

39  
40 That concludes my presentation.

41  
42 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, thank you. ADF&G  
43 comments, Mike.

44  
45 MR. COFFING: Yes, Mr. Chairman, thank you.  
46 I got the mike moved here so you can hear me. Mike Coffing,  
47 Fish and Game Subsistence. Again, I would mention to the  
48 Council to -- let me find the page number here. Just  
49 disregard what shows up as comments on this page for this  
50 proposal and I'm going to read to you the comments that the

00080

1 State submitted on this proposal.

2

3 MR. J. ANDREW: What page?

4

5 MR. COFFING: And what I'm going to be  
6 reading from essentially is Page 49 -- excuse me, go to the  
7 back here. Page 64 in your booklet contains the State's  
8 comments. So the State's comments on this proposal, as the  
9 proposal was originally submitted, that's the proposal that  
10 was submitted to the Council here.

11

12 Again, the State had no recommendation at this time.  
13 So of the other things that we commented on was that the  
14 proposal does not specify all of the communities that may  
15 have traditionally hunted black bear in Unit 21. The data  
16 from so of the recent Division of Subsistence harvest  
17 monitoring projects confirmed use of black bear in Unit 21 by  
18 residents in Galena, Kaltag, Nulato, and Ruby. And by  
19 neighboring communities of Tanana, which is in Unit 20(C),  
20 and also Huslia, which is in Unit 24.

21

22 Now, in the original proposal, the original proposal  
23 did not include Unit 24, but it included -- it recommended in  
24 the proposal to include all of Unit 23 communities. And Unit  
25 23 communities are more distant, are further away from Unit  
26 21 than are some communities in Unit 24 neighboring them.  
27 Some of the vague language in the proposal, such as "to  
28 include others that have traditionally hunted in Unit 21" may  
29 have been put there to get some discussion going from the  
30 Regional Councils and the public to identify other  
31 communities that may have customarily and traditionally  
32 hunted and used black bear in Unit 21.

33

34 The State feels that this proposal should identify  
35 specifically which users are intended to be included, not be  
36 real vague about it, and would provide some source  
37 information from the Division of Subsistence Technical Papers  
38 describing subsistence use by other communities that we feel  
39 should be included in the analysis -- or in the evaluation of  
40 the proposal.

41

42 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

43

44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. Let me  
45 call Jeff Reeves, Kuigpagmiut, Mountain Village.

46

47 MR. REEVES: My name is Jeff Reeves, I'm the  
48 Natural Resources Director for Kuigpagmiut. Back in December  
49 I sent a letter in to, I believe, Mr. Demientieff. Our  
50 feeling is that -- it's very similar to Fish and Game's, that



00081

1 the wording "others" is just too vague. When you look at how  
2 the past was -- excuse me, the C&T was all rural residents  
3 and now looking at the new wording saying "Russian Mission  
4 and others" we're overlooking the fact that residents of  
5 Marshall, St. Marys, Pitkas Point and Mountain Village who  
6 traditionally hunt 21(E) for moose, that they also take black  
7 bear when they're up there and they see them.

8  
9 Like I said in my letter, chances are that wording  
10 "others" would probably cover us, but if it came down to, you  
11 know, a situation we'd have to fight to prove it.

12  
13 This is an added note. What I noticed in here was on  
14 Page 42, I guess, I believe this is what Fish and Wildlife  
15 did. It says here "in communities with or near spruce  
16 woodlands, such as Lower Kalskag, Russian Mission, Marshall  
17 and St. Marys." Right there they've just listed two of our  
18 villages. Yet, according to what was written in this propose  
19 [sic], those were left out.

20  
21 And we also feel, too, which I didn't write, but  
22 yeah, why should Unit 23 be considered if they're farther  
23 away from us? You know, when basically the only time we're  
24 in there is in the falltime, but we do take black bear when  
25 we're up there. You know, this year when I took my moose I  
26 missed a black bear, but my family eats it, my wife is  
27 Yup'ik, my son is half Yup'ik, so -- and I know I'm not the  
28 only one who eats black bear meat and takes the opportunity  
29 to get them when you see them.

30  
31 Thank you.

32  
33 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Jeff. (In  
34 Yup'ik)

35  
36 INTERPRETER NICK: Any comments?

37  
38 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Let me ask.....

39  
40 MR. THOMPSON: (In Yup'ik)

41  
42 INTERPRETER NICK: John asked if this was in  
43 regard to a moose and black bear proposal or just a black  
44 bear proposal.

45  
46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Only black bear.

47  
48 MR. THOMPSON: Okay.

49  
50 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Is there any other

00082

1 agencies like to have a comment.

2

3 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman.

4

5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, go ahead.

6

7 MR. MATHEWS: This is Vince Mathews, the  
8 Regional Coordinator for Eastern Interior. Eastern Interior  
9 took action on this proposal this weekend, if you'd like me  
10 to share their recommendation?

11

12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, go ahead.

13

14 MR. MATHEWS: And if people can't hear there,  
15 maybe Anchorage office can relay these, seems like they have  
16 a better connection.

17

18 Eastern Interior met this weekend in Delta Junction,  
19 took up Proposal 43 and voted to oppose the proposal. The  
20 Council opposed the proposal because to exclude qualified  
21 subsistence users and because there is no need to restrict  
22 subsistence harvest when black bear populations are abundant.  
23 And, finally, further areas of (indiscernible - phone fade)  
24 data to support restricting rural residents may affect the  
25 subsistence users. They voted to oppose this.

26

27 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

28

29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah. Thank you. For  
30 the record, will you stated your name?

31

32 MR. MATHEWS: Yes, my name is Vince Mathews  
33 with the Fish and Wildlife Service out of Fairbanks.

34

35 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you.

36

37 Any other agencies? Tim Andrew, AVCP.

38

39 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
40 Like Jeff Reeves of Kuigpagmiut, we would oppose the  
41 inclusion of "others." We have officially 121, but would  
42 support language there that would sort of specify the  
43 communities and putting Marshall, Pilot Station, St. Marys,  
44 at this point.

45

46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Hold on. We're having a  
47 problem with the.....

48

49 (Off record comments - re: Court reporter getting  
50 microphone set)

00083

1 MR. T. ANDREW: Okay. Thank you. Once  
2 again, thank you, Mr. Chairman, for this opportunity to  
3 express our opinion on the moose hunt -- Proposal 43. Like  
4 Jeff Reeves of Kuigpagmiut stated, AVCP's position would also  
5 be to remove "others" because that is too vague. But the  
6 communities of Yukon River corridor that use Unit 21 to  
7 subsistence hunt and fish. That may include the people of  
8 Scammon and Hooper and Chevak that may also hunt in that  
9 area.

10  
11 That would be the extent of my statement.

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Tim. Any more  
14 agency comments?

15  
16 (No audible responses)

17  
18 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If it not, public  
19 testimonies.

20  
21 (No audible responses)

22  
23 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If none, is there any  
24 written public comments, Andrew.

25  
26 MR. J. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,  
27 there was only one written public comment, that came from  
28 Kuigpagmiut and Jeff Reeves just described it earlier and  
29 that's the only one we have on record.

30  
31 Thank you.

32  
33 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Andrew.  
34 Regional Council recommendation, justification. What is the  
35 action of the Regional Council?

36  
37 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

38  
39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

40  
41 MR. L. WILDE: Scammon Bay, mostly members of  
42 the community of Scammon Bay hunt in that area, not so much  
43 Hooper Bay and Chevak. I guess I'm the only one from Hooper  
44 Bay that hunt in that area because that's my old stomping  
45 ground. But we do oppose the deletion or the -- I guess  
46 deletion could be used, of the other villages that are within  
47 that region. I think we would, as written, we would oppose  
48 this proposal because the names of the other villages are not  
49 included or excluded from it.

50

00084

1                   CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: My understanding that  
2 your motion to oppose. The reason is not include other  
3 villages, should be included on this proposal.  
4

5                   MR. L. WILDE: No, Mr. Chairman, that was not  
6 motion. I just simply stated that we would oppose it because  
7 of the other villages being excluded. The other villages'  
8 names being excluded from the proposal.  
9

10                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Let me ask again,  
11 Regional Council, what is your recommendation to this motion?  
12 I mean to this proposal?  
13

14                  Fritz.  
15

16                  MR. GEORGE: Yeah, Mr. Chairman. (In Yup'ik)  
17

18                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion -- is there  
19 any second to the motion by Fritz George?  
20

21                  MR. CHARLES: Second the motion.  
22

23                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by Charles James.  
24

25                  The motion is (In Yup'ik)  
26

27                  MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik)  
28

29                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion was include  
30 those others that mentioned just a while ago. Amend this  
31 proposal -- proposal is amended to include those other  
32 villages on this proposal. And it was second.  
33

34                  Discussion?  
35

36                  MR. HANSON: Mr. Chairman.  
37

38                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John.  
39

40                  MR. HANSON: Yeah, thanks, Mr. Chairman. The  
41 amendment to the proposal would include other villages. Which  
42 villages are these, Chevak, Hooper, Scammon?  
43

44                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Mountain Village, Pilot  
45 Station, St. Marys, Marshall, Scammon Bay, Hooper Bay,  
46 Chevak.....  
47

48                  MS. McCLENAHAN: Pitkas Point.  
49

50                  CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: .....Pitkas Point.

00085

1 Qu yana, thank you, Pat.

2

3 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

4

5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

6 MR. L. WILDE: Pat, I don't have my regs with  
7 me right now, could you name the as is in the regs for C&T  
8 for black bear and Unit 21 and 23?

9

10 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes, just a minute, please.  
11 For Unit 21, black bear. Unit 21 black bear is all rural  
12 residents at the time, three bears, July 1st to June 30th.  
13 You want to know for Unit 23 also?

14

15 MR. L. WILDE: No, I think I got the answer I  
16 needed, all rural residents pretty much covers it. Thanks.

17

18 MS. McCLENAHAN: Uh-huh.

19

20 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion to  
21 amend?

22

23 (No audible responses)

24

25 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If not, the floor is open  
26 to accept or reject the amendment. I request for a roll call  
27 to amend.

28

29 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

30

31 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

32

33 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion.

34

35 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

36

37 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

38

39 MR. McCANN: Yes.

40

41 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

42

43 (No response)

44

45 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

46

47 MR. HANSON: Yes

48

49 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

50

00086

1 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

2

3 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

4

5 (No response)

6

7 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

8

9 MR. L. WILDE: No.

10

11 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

12

13 (No response)

14

15 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

16

17 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

18

19 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson.

20

21 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

22

23 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, eight yes, one no,  
24 three excused.

25

26 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion accepted. The  
27 motion was include other mentioned villages for amendment.  
28 Now the floor is open on Proposal 43. (In Yup'ik) accept or  
29 reject.

30

31 MR. THOMPSON: I move to accept the proposal  
32 with amendments.

33

34 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion was to accept  
35 proposal with the amendments. Is there any second to the  
36 motion.

37

38 MR. NICOLAI: Mr. Chair (In Yup'ik)

39

40 INTERPRETER NICK: Ilarion Nicolai says that  
41 he do not understand the motion because he needs  
42 clarification as to what villages are going to be included.

43

44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Main motion now.

45

46 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

47

48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Main proposal.

49

50 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman, I don't think

00087

1 there was no motion to accept this proposal, that was just a  
2 motion to amend the proposal, that was all. To include those  
3 villages.

4  
5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: That's what I saying. So  
6 need that regular proposal just amended.

7  
8 MR. THOMPSON: Just amended.

9  
10 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: We need someone expertise  
11 here that that could be done. Sue, will you come and give us  
12 an explanation?

13  
14 MS. DETWILER: My understanding was that your  
15 earlier action was to amend Proposal 43 to include the other  
16 communities that were mentioned in the discussion. You  
17 passed that amendment, eight to one, so now you would be  
18 voting on the main proposal, which would be Proposal 43 with  
19 amendment to include all those other communities.

20  
21 MR. L. WILDE: You could also entertain a  
22 motion to oppose.

23  
24 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: You understand now what I  
25 was requesting a while ago? Let me request one more time.

26  
27 MR. THOMPSON: Going back to the main motion.

28  
29 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Huh?

30  
31 MR. THOMPSON: We're not in the main motion  
32 yet, just amendments.

33  
34 MR. L. WILDE: There was no motion to oppose  
35 or accept this proposal, Mr. Chairman. I'd like to move to  
36 oppose Proposal Number 99-43.

37  
38 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: You move that we'll  
39 oppose Proposal 43? Is there a second.

40  
41 MR. HANSON: Second.

42  
43 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by John Hanson.  
44 Request for roll call.

45  
46 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

47  
48 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

49  
50 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion.

00088

1 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

2

3 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

4

5 MR. McCANN: Yes.

6

7 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

8

9 (No response)

10

11 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

12

13 MR. HANSON: Yes

14

15 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

16

17 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

18

19 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

20

21 (No response)

22

23 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

24

25 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

26

27 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

28

29 (No response)

30

31 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

32

33 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

34

35 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson.

36

37 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

38

39 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yes, three

40 excused.

41

42 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion is to oppose

43 Proposal 43. Motion carried. Opposed same sign.

44

45 (No opposing responses)

46

47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: We're going to have a

48 five minute break.

49

50 (Off record - 3:34 p.m)



00089

1 (On record - 3:40 p.m.)

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: We're going to try to  
4 finish this with your -- I got some many in our hands and  
5 each one tell me do this and that and all that, so we're  
6 going to Proposal 99-45, that's to shorten the moose season  
7 in Unit 21(A). Dave Fisher. Is Dave available or what?

8

9 MS. DETWILER: Ask if Pete is.....

10

11 MS. McCLENAHAN: Will Steve Kovach do that  
12 one?

13

14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Steve Kovach. Proposal  
15 45.

16

17 MR. KOVACH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This  
18 proposal was submitted by an individual from Holy Cross. the  
19 proposal is asking for two things, first it would shorten the  
20 fall season, the existing season is August 20th through  
21 September 25, it would shorten that by 15 days where it would  
22 end on September 10th. The second part of the proposal is  
23 for the 10 day February hunt and it would actually make a  
24 clarification that would specifically state any islands  
25 within the Innoko or Yukon Rivers are also closed to hunting  
26 of moose during that 10 day season. Currently there is a  
27 restriction that no moose may be taken within one half mile  
28 of both of these rivers.

29

30 The current customary and traditional use  
31 determination for moose in 21(E) includes residents of 21(E)  
32 as well as residents of Russian Mission. The proposal was  
33 submitted primarily in a response to a concern from people in  
34 Holy Cross due to rapid increases in the number of non-local  
35 moose hunters, primarily, in the fall season.

36

37 The proposal that actually failed to address the  
38 proponent's concerns because the non-unit resident and non-  
39 resident hunters could continue to hunt in Unit 21(E) under  
40 the existing State regulations. The State regulations are  
41 currently the same as they are for the Federal season and, as  
42 additionally, non-Alaska residents are allowed to hunt in the  
43 same area from September 5 through 25.

44

45 The current Federal regulations for the February  
46 season restrict hunting for within one half mile of both the  
47 Innoko and Yukon Rivers. The request here actually would  
48 just provide some clarification that even the large islands  
49 contained within those rivers would be closed to hunting of  
50 moose during the February season.

00090

1           Surveys conducted from 1993 through 1995 by the Alaska  
2 Department of Fish and Game and the Innoko National Wildlife  
3 Refuge indicate a very healthy and highly productive moose  
4 population in this area.

5  
6           Harvest reports from this area indicate a relatively  
7 consistent success rate by rural residents for the 15 year  
8 period of 1983 through 1988 or 1998, excuse me. The average  
9 success for rural residents was 78 percent. In contrast the  
10 small number of non-rural hunters who went into this area to  
11 hunt during this same period experienced an average success  
12 rate of only 17 percent. The number of non-rural hunters to  
13 those -- to the number of rural hunters is -- the difference  
14 there is quite significant. Non-rural hunters only comprise  
15 about 10 percent of the total, between 10 and 15 percent of  
16 the total number of hunters.

17  
18           As far as the effects of change anticipated if this  
19 proposal were to go through, there is neither a positive or a  
20 negative affect anticipated from these regulations. While  
21 the proposal would close the latter portion of the Federal  
22 season, with the intent of reducing harvest by non-locals,  
23 the State season for both resident and non-resident hunters  
24 would remain open through the 25th of September, as they  
25 currently do. The number of non-local hunters and the total  
26 harvest would not significantly change as a result of this  
27 proposal.

28  
29           Because of this, the preliminary staff conclusion is  
30 to oppose the proposal. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

31  
32           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, thank you. State  
33 Department comments.

34  
35           MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, Council, thank  
36 you. Mike Coffing, Fish and Game Subsistence. The State's  
37 comments on the proposal, original proposal, that was  
38 submitted was to do not support it. And the reasons are that  
39 there are no biological reason to limit the moose hunting  
40 opportunity in Unit 21(E). The State feels that the moose  
41 population in this subunit is currently high.

42  
43           Now the State's fall season is the season that the  
44 State has during the fall in Unit 21(E) runs from September 5  
45 to September 25. The seasons being proposed, the Federal  
46 season that's being proposed in this proposal would be  
47 reduced from a current 37 days down to 22 days and would run,  
48 then, from August 20 through September 10. Now, the affects  
49 would be -- a couple of net affects here. One would be that  
50 a 40 percent reduction in the Federal season and the State

00091

1 and the Federal season would be even more far out of  
2 alignment than they currently are.

3  
4 Now, there's a mix of Federal and State lands there  
5 and the effects of this proposal would be to increase the  
6 confusion among hunters about where they can hunt and when  
7 they can hunt, given the mix of State and Federal lands in  
8 Unit 21(E).

9  
10 Thank you.

11  
12 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. AVCP,  
13 Tim Andrew.

14  
15 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
16 AVCP would stand in opposition to this proposal primarily  
17 because it would limit the opportunity for the people in the  
18 lower rivers to participate in this important fall season  
19 hunt.

20  
21 Thank you.

22  
23 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Tim.  
24 Kuigpagmiut, Jeff Reeves.

25  
26 MR. REEVES: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,  
27 Kuigpagmiut would like to see this opposed. Most of our  
28 residents hunt during the fall season and we feel that if it  
29 is shortened, even though the State season goes on it might  
30 later on come around and affect that. The majority of our  
31 hunters do not hunt until well after the 10th, so their  
32 success rate, hopefully, will be higher as the moose have  
33 moved down and closer. The reason they do that, at least for  
34 Mountain Village, it's about a six hour trip up there and for  
35 a lot a people just buying that much gas can be a hardship,  
36 so they need to make their time up there count, so they can  
37 feed their families.

38  
39 Thank you.

40  
41 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: You got that letter from  
42 James Luke?

43  
44 MR. REEVES: Yes, I do. This letter was  
45 written by James Luke, he work for Orutsararmiut. Basically  
46 this letter states: Dear Mr. Wilde, Orutsararmiut, Mountain  
47 Village residents and subsistence users are very much  
48 concerned and opposed to Proposal 45, submitted by a Holy  
49 Cross resident in Game Management Unit 21(E).

50

00092

1           This proposal, if approved by the Federal Subsistence  
2 Board, will shorten moose hunting season by 15 days for all  
3 Lower Yukon residents that do moose hunt on Federal lands in  
4 GMU 21(E). GMU 21(E) line ends on Twelve Mile Slough and  
5 Lower Yukon moose hunters usually hunt in that vicinity of  
6 the lower end of Paimiut Slough.

7  
8           Most of the hunters from Lower Yukon do not leave  
9 until between September 8th and 10th, so they might have a  
10 better chance to catch their moose after they have started to  
11 move around, sometime after the 10th of September. We  
12 believe that there is a high density of moose population in  
13 GMU 21(E) and no biological reason to shorten moose season  
14 hunting there.

15  
16           Thank you for conveying this important message for us  
17 to the Federal Subsistence Board. Sincerely, James Luke,  
18 Orutsararmiut National Resource representative.

19  
20           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Jeff. Is  
21 there any other agency comment to this proposal?

22  
23           (No audible responses)

24  
25           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Is there any public  
26 testimony to this proposal?

27  
28           (No audible responses)

29  
30           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If there's not, Regional  
31 Council recommendation.

32  
33           MR. J. ANDREW: (In Yup'ik)

34  
35           INTERPRETER NICK: John Andrew, who is  
36 coordinator of the Regional Council, explained to the local  
37 residents the language of Proposal Number 45 in Yup'ik.

38  
39           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Andrew. (In  
40 Yup'ik)

41  
42           INTERPRETER NICK: Chairman Harry Wilde is  
43 explaining to local people here in Alakanuk that a lot of  
44 young men from Lower Yukon usually go up to 21(E) and go  
45 moose hunting in falltime. And the he said, if they go way  
46 up river to 21(E) and then hunt moose they will be forced to  
47 stay only five days and the, you know, come back empty-handed  
48 if they don't harvest any moose.

49  
50           CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Regional Council

00093

1 recommendation and justification.

2

3 MR. L. WILDE: Mr. Chairman.

4

5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Lester.

6

7 MR. L. WILDE: I move to oppose 99-45.

8

9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion to  
10 oppose Proposal 99-45, is there a second to the motion?

11

12 MR. THOMPSON: Second it.

13

14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: John B. Thompson.

15 Discussion? I'd like to ask staff and also maybe Department  
16 of Fish and Game, maybe staff first. I've been hearing from  
17 the people that hunts up there in that area, they're saying  
18 that how come we always have to wait until September 5th  
19 after we travel so many miles, why -- while up river people  
20 start hunting and we couldn't hunt and wait.

21

22 When I look at that Proposal 45, 21(E), their already  
23 start hunting up there in that area on August. Is there any  
24 response from staff why the Lower Yukon people, when they go  
25 up there hunting, they always have to wait until September  
26 5th? Please respond to this question. Sue.

27

28 (Pause)

29

30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Looking at this Proposal  
31 45, the proposal before us, change it's open Unit 21(E),  
32 August 20 and close September 25. However, when the people  
33 travel from Lower Yukon area they have to start hunting  
34 September 5th.

35

36 MS. DETWILER: Mr. Chair, the reason that  
37 residents from down here would have to start hunting at a  
38 later time than the residents in Unit 21(E) is because of the  
39 customary and traditional use determination. Under the  
40 Federal regulations, the only people who are eligible to hunt  
41 in the early season, under the Federal regulations, are the  
42 residents of Unit 21(E) and residents of Russian Mission.  
43 The remaining hunters in this unit aren't qualified under the  
44 Federal subsistence regulations to hunt in the earlier  
45 season. Therefore, they have to wait until the State season  
46 hunts and hunt under the State regulations which start  
47 September the 5th.

48

49 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I think the reason I'm  
50 asking this question, there's quite few boys that have been --

00094

1 went over to the checkpoint and there wasn't any certain  
2 person was there. However, when they asked them if this area  
3 is open, they say, yes. That's a problem. I think the  
4 hunters would have to be like from Lower Yukon area, all  
5 those from here. They have to know what days it has to be  
6 opened. When you look at the regulations there nothing such  
7 a thing there it's opened September 5th for Lower Yukon  
8 people or other areas.

9  
10 MS. DETWILER: Are you referring to the  
11 Federal Subsistence book?

12  
13 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah. I refer to Federal  
14 Subsistence.

15  
16 MS. DETWILER: Generally, the Federal  
17 Subsistence book does not include the State regulations, it  
18 only includes the Federal regulations.

19  
20 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I think I'm trying to get  
21 a comment, both, from Federal and State right now.

22  
23 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, thank you. Mike  
24 Coffing, Fish and Game Subsistence. This is an example where  
25 we have seasons that are different. We have Federal seasons  
26 that open August 20th and those apply on Federal land. And  
27 we have State seasons that open September 5. this is the  
28 kind of example of where we have different opening dates,  
29 different seasons dates on Federal land and State lands, it  
30 can be very confusing to hunters.

31  
32 Much of 21(E) that is along the river is under State  
33 jurisdiction, that is, it's private lands or corporation  
34 lands, which falls under the State regulations. The Federal  
35 regulations -- if the Federal seasons are different than the  
36 State, which they are in this case, they open earlier, the  
37 Federal regulations apply only to people that have been  
38 recognized as having customary and traditional use in the  
39 Federal regulation book. Now, currently that includes only  
40 residents of Russian Mission for Unit 18. That's why Russian  
41 Mission and residents of 21 can hunt in 21(E) earlier than  
42 people down river.

43  
44 Now, the State season does have some overlap with the  
45 Federal season, they both close September 25, so that's why  
46 on September 5th, if you live down river of Russian Mission,  
47 you can come up -- you can hunt on either State or Federal  
48 lands then because the season is open -- you know, opened to  
49 everybody then. But prior to the State season opening the  
50 only people that are qualified to hunt are those that have

00095

1 customary and traditional use finding that you have in the  
2 regulations. And Russian Mission is the only community, at  
3 this time, that's recognized in Unit 18.

4  
5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Bill.

6  
7 MR. McCANN: I couldn't really understand  
8 what you're really going for, like you said something about  
9 State regulations and Federal regulations. And on top of  
10 that corporation land. I don't know who was actually  
11 hunting, but I think that the people should have rights to  
12 hunt for food subsistence-wise, no matter who's land it is.  
13 By corporation land, that shouldn't affect that up, talk to  
14 the people who owns that land. But nowadays, we are affected  
15 by corporations all over the -- around. People are fighting  
16 together for something like wood or stuff like that nowadays.  
17 But actually us, we didn't ask for corporation land before,  
18 but white people give it to us to run it, but we got a  
19 problem for it. That way I think this season should be --  
20 when it's opened it should be opened no matter who it is.  
21 Not saying you come from someplace you cannot hunt. I think  
22 that's pretty wrong because I know sports hunters going  
23 anyplace else -- if I fly up to where this distance and hunt.

24  
25 I think the main thing is to the people in the  
26 villages around close to it, they'll hunt for food. That  
27 should be fixed by getting the people to have rights to hunt  
28 and get their foods for their childrens and family.  
29 Sometimes these regulations are going backwards, two steps.  
30 They don't think about the people that are using it. I know  
31 nobody, even us, we're not planning anything. We can't  
32 control anything anyway. The moose is there, we cannot  
33 control it. Someday we're going to find out there's no more  
34 moose, no matter even though we don't hunt, if we fight about  
35 it. The good Lord will clean it up for us. He's the one  
36 that's controlling, so we, the people -- any people should  
37 have the right to hunt when it's open as far as we can go,  
38 open season. We cannot -- see, without even -- I mean, if  
39 it's cold we cannot hunt, we know that. If it's open  
40 somewhere else, the people should have rights to hunt no  
41 matter whose land it is. That why I don't really go for  
42 that. I'd like to see the people have rights because they're  
43 hunting for food. We should do that.

44  
45 Quyana.

46  
47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, I think this motion  
48 is to discuss -- the motion was oppose Proposal 45 and  
49 second.

50

00096

1 MR. L. WILDE: Question.

2

3 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question has been called.

4 Request for a roll call.

5

6 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

7

8 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

9

10 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion Nicolai.

11

12 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

13

14 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

15

16 MR. McCANN: Yes.

17

18 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

19

20 (No response)

21

22 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

23

24 MR. HANSON: Are we voting to oppose?

25

26 MR. GEORGE: Yes.

27

28 MR. HANSON: Yeah.

29

30 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

31

32 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

33

34 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

35

36 (No response)

37

38 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

39

40 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

41

42 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

43

44 (No response)

45

46 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

47

48 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

49

50 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson, Sr.



00097

1 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

2

3 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yes, three  
4 excused.

5

6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: The motion is opposed and  
7 passed for Proposal 45.

8

9 Now next on proposal is -- it says the following  
10 proposal originated in Bristol Bay Region and affect  
11 residents of Yukon-Kuskokwim Region. Proposal 99-37, revise  
12 C&T for caribou in Unit 17 to include residents of Unit 18.  
13 Pat, you're still there?

14

15 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes, Mr. Chairman, I'm here  
16 and I'm ready to go ahead with the analysis for Proposals  
17 99-37 and 99-38. We combined the analysis because they both  
18 speak to similar issues.

19

20 Proposal 99-37 was submitted by AVCP, it would expand  
21 the existing customary and traditional use determinations for  
22 caribou in all of Unit 17(A) and 17(B) including all rural  
23 residents of Unit 18.

24

25 Proposal 99-38 was submitted by Joshua Cleveland of  
26 Quinhagak, and this request that the rural residents of Eek  
27 and Quinhagak be added to the existing customary and  
28 traditional use determination for caribou in Unit 17(A).

29

30 In 1998, Proposal 98-54, requesting a positive  
31 customary and traditional use determination for caribou in  
32 Unit 17(A) and (B) for the rural residents of Unit 18, was  
33 reviewed by the Councils and the Board and it was deferred  
34 because we lacked complete information on some of the  
35 communities.

36

37 The Bristol Bay Subsistence Regional Advisory Council  
38 requested more specific information on seven of the Kuskokwim  
39 region communities in Unit 18. Those communities are  
40 Goodnews Bay, Platinum, Quinhagak, Eek, Tuntutuliak, Napakiak  
41 and Bethel. Those are the communities I will be covering  
42 today in the synopsis.

43

44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Pat.

45

46 MS. McCLENAHAN: Information about -- I'm  
47 sorry. With reference to a long-term subsistence pattern of  
48 use, many of the residents of these seven Kuskokwim River  
49 communities are related to one another. Also have relatives  
50 in Akiak, Akiachak and Kwethluk. A number of the members of

00098

1 the communities under discussion have moved one or more times  
2 among the villages.

3  
4 Reindeer herders who use the area between the Middle  
5 and Lower Kuskokwim River in Unit 18 and the western portions  
6 of Unit 17(A) and 17(B) beginning in the late 1800s came from  
7 Kwethluk, Akiak, Akiachak, Tuluksak and other nearby  
8 villages. They worked together, hunted together and married  
9 among their communities. Strong ties of kinship, partnership  
10 and friendship still exist among many residents of these  
11 communities, and they continue to hunt together and share the  
12 same subsistence hunting areas. Information of use by these  
13 seven communities was gather in 1998 by our Coordinator, John  
14 Andrew in a series of interviews with residents of these  
15 communities.

16  
17 On page 83 you can find a map of some of the camps  
18 that were reported by some of the community members at  
19 Platinum, Napakiak, Tuntutuliak and Bethel. And I'd also  
20 like to tell you that in the appendix there are photos of  
21 each resident and others from the Lower Kuskokwim communities  
22 who are subsistence hunting, fishing and gathering at Heart  
23 Lake.

24  
25 These Kuskokwim communities exhibit a consistent  
26 harvest and use of fish and wildlife, near, or reasonably  
27 accessible from their communities or area in that they have  
28 uses a consistent definable subsistence use area for hunting  
29 caribou over many years. One of the first well-documented  
30 uses of the proposal area was that of the area used by the  
31 reindeer herders; local herders sometimes had to take the  
32 reindeer long distances for good food, in what is today Unit  
33 17(A) and 17(B).

34  
35 In the late 1860s caribou disappeared almost  
36 completely from the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta and they've only  
37 recently begun to return. Kuskokwim River residents wishing  
38 to hunt caribou had to go into Units 17(A) and 17(B) as well  
39 as other areas some distance away to get caribou. Yukon-  
40 Kuskokwim subsistence hunters are opportunistic and take a  
41 variety of resources on any hunting trip. And you can see  
42 that in the photographs at the end of this analysis.

43  
44 During the periods from the 1920s until the late  
45 1940s the traditional seasonal round of activities was  
46 interrupted for Lower and Middle Kuskokwim River families who  
47 did take part in reindeer herding. Herders and their  
48 families had to supplement their diets with traditional  
49 subsistence resources, but they had to take them  
50 opportunistically in the areas where the reindeer were

00099

1 grazing, whenever the resources presented themselves.

2

3 Quinhagak and Goodnews Bay residents hunt caribou in  
4 the mountain valleys beyond the headwaters of the Kisaralik,  
5 Kanektok, Arolik and the Togiak Rivers in portions of Unit  
6 17(A), 17(B) and 18. In 1985 a Fish and Wildlife Service  
7 employee, Ron Thuma prepared some maps, subsistence use area  
8 maps and is involved the community of Quinhagak. And those  
9 maps confirmed this pattern. In addition to that there is a  
10 formal report that was done in 1986, I believe. That effort  
11 describes a similar use pattern. And those maps are  
12 represented in the appendix.

13

14 These communities do not systematically use the  
15 Nushagak Peninsula in Unit 17(A). Platinum resident and at  
16 least one Goodnews Bay resident have relatives and hunting  
17 partners in Koliganek, Stuyahok and Aleknagik, and according  
18 to one Platinum resident they go to Unit 17(A) to hunt with  
19 family members.

20

21 But my preliminary -- staff preliminary conclusions  
22 are, and I'd like to point out to you that Proposal 99-37  
23 takes in Proposal 99-38, so I am recommending support for  
24 99-37 to support a positive customary and traditional use  
25 determination for the residents of Napakiak, Tuntutuliak,  
26 Eek, Quinhagak, Goodnews Bay and Platinum for caribou in Unit  
27 17(A) and in a more geographically specific area of Unit  
28 17(B). And to support a positive customary and traditional  
29 use determination for the residents of Bethel for caribou in  
30 a more geographically specific area of Unit 17(B) that  
31 coincides with their history of subsistence use in that unit.  
32 For Bethel, John Andrew did not get any information of the  
33 residents use in Unit 17(A).

34

35 And finally oppose granting a positive customary and  
36 traditional use determination for the remainder of Unit 18  
37 communities for caribou in Unit 17.

38

39 I feel that sufficient information about each of the  
40 eight factors, include subsistence use areas maps and/or  
41 verbal descriptions of use areas exists to support the  
42 recommendation.

43

44 That concludes my presentation, Mr. Chair.

45

46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Pat.

47

48 Department of Fish and Game comments.

49

50 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, members of the

00100

1 Council, at the time this proposal was submitted and we saw  
2 the original proposal the State did not have any comments on  
3 the C&T portion of this proposal. It's obvious from the  
4 information that's been compiled by John Andrew and Pat  
5 McClenahan presented here, that it certainly shows the  
6 residents of these communities have a patten of use over in  
7 17(A) and 17(B). There's certainly some evidence that people  
8 were over there using the land for various purposes,  
9 including reindeer herding.

10  
11 So with that, that's all the comments the State has  
12 on this at this time.

13  
14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. Any  
15 other agencies? AVCP.

16  
17 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, the  
18 reason why we supported this proposal above Kwethluk was  
19 primarily because we wanted to open up the subsistence  
20 opportunity to let residents of Unit 18 in 17(A) and (B).  
21 There have been some years where the residents of Unit 18  
22 have not had the opportunity to hunt caribou. Also  
23 (indiscernible) because wandering characteristics of caribou.  
24 We would want to see the subsistence opportunity extended to  
25 the residents so that, you know, when that time comes that  
26 they have that opportunity to participate in a caribou hunt  
27 in 17(A) and 17(B) if need be. This is -- the way we see  
28 this proposal is primarily expanding this, this is another  
29 opportunity for the people in this area.

30  
31 Thank you very much.

32  
33 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Tim. Any  
34 other agencies? Pete (In Yup'ik)

35  
36 MR. ABRAHAM: Mr. Chairman, this is Pete  
37 Abraham from Togiak.

38  
39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: (In Yup'ik)

40  
41 INTERPRETER NICK: Pete Abraham (In Yup'ik)

42  
43 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Yup'ik)

44  
45 INTERPRETER NICK: He said that the section  
46 that he mentioned in Unit 17, he said that he will work on  
47 that when he get back to his region. Besides that, he don't  
48 have any other comments toward that until he sits down with  
49 the Bristol Bay Regional Staff.

50

00101

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Okay, quyana.

2  
3 MR. ABRAHAM: Quyana.

4  
5 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any other written public  
6 comments, Andrew?

7  
8 MR. J. ANDREW: There were no written public  
9 comments toward 37 or 38.

10  
11 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any other public comments  
12 on Proposal 37? Jeff, go ahead.

13  
14 MR. REEVES: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
15 I'd like to see the Board or Kuigpagmiut would like to see  
16 the Board support 37. I just look at this way, that it kind  
17 of goes back to what Mr. McCann said earlier, why should only  
18 they be able to hunt. I believe that chances are, you know,  
19 our four villages that we represent, we wouldn't be taking  
20 off everyday to go down and caribou hunt down in 17(A) or  
21 (B), but, you know, if you look at for me, for example, I  
22 have relatives in 17(A) and what if something happened to my  
23 father-in-law and I needed to provide for my mother-in-law  
24 and her family? With how it's written, legally, I couldn't  
25 do that. With something like this I could.

26  
27 Or if the situation came where my wife and my own  
28 family needed something and we happened to be there.  
29 Granted, if I could take a caribou then I could still feed my  
30 family. Chances are that most of the -- especially the Yukon  
31 River people in Unit 18 aren't going to be really  
32 detrimentally affecting this population if they have the  
33 chance to. And also I believe if Proposal 37 is accepted as  
34 it's written it will also accommodate Proposal 38 and it  
35 would still include the people of Quinhagak and Eek.

36  
37 Thank you.

38  
39 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Jeff. Any  
40 other public to testify?

41  
42 (No audible responses)

43  
44 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If there's not, Regional  
45 Council deliberation, recommendation, justification. John  
46 Hanson.

47  
48 MR. HANSON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Yeah,  
49 looking at this proposal I -- some part of it is opposing  
50 granting C&T, which we all know our elders in the past they

00102

1 know about the caribou migration in the whole Y-K Delta.  
2 Long time ago there used to be caribou around here, over in  
3 the flats between Bethel and the Yukon. (In Yup'ik)

4  
5 INTERPRETER NICK: John Hanson says that a  
6 long time ago there used to be reindeer in Y-K Delta, there  
7 used to be hardly any caribou. Hanson says that some  
8 village, you know, they don't have any C&T determination, but  
9 those people who worked on the C&T determinations for the  
10 respective villages don't know the needs of those villages.  
11 A long, long time ago there used to be caribou and reindeer  
12 in this area. And there's an elder who lives there now,  
13 Thomas Gigeel (ph), living here in Alakanuk, he has stories  
14 about caribou that used to be migrating through here or this  
15 used to be their -- they used to hunt caribou, they used to  
16 harvest adult caribou instead of calves.

17  
18 The idea of C&T does affect some of the communities,  
19 you know, some of that needs to be opposed also. Those of us  
20 who are sitting on the Regional Council, we know some of the  
21 history of caribou, even though they were not present in the  
22 Y-K Delta anymore. There's more and more Mulchatna herd and  
23 Kilbuck herd that are going to be expanding to the Yukon-  
24 Kuskokwim Delta. And then some of them are going to be  
25 migrating slowly toward the Yukon area.

26  
27 And speaking of the Western herd, it's being pushed  
28 toward Yukon and then they're being reported behind Kotlik,  
29 north of Kotlik, not too far from Kotlik. But some of the  
30 elders that we have now, they remember the history that there  
31 used to be a lot of history that proves there used to be  
32 caribou here in this Delta.

33  
34 If we support this proposal we will not only help  
35 ourselves but we will also help the residents of Unit 18. We  
36 are aware that the Mulchatna herd are slowly migrating toward  
37 Kuskokwim and the Yukon and there's been report of caribou  
38 between Hooper Bay and Bethel.

39  
40 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion to  
41 37? Charles.

42  
43 MR. CHARLES: Mr. Chairman (In Yup'ik)

44  
45 INTERPRETER NICK: James Charles from  
46 Tuntutuliak also said he is also from Tuntutuliak, but he  
47 used to hunt 17(B). There used to be no caribou in Unit 18.  
48 I used to go hunting in 17(B) and also go moose hunting in  
49 the Yukon from my village. When there's no caribou we try to  
50 find animals to harvest, no matter what the distance may

00103

1 be. There are a lot of reports of caribou increasing in Y-K  
2 Delta area, but it won't be increasing all the time.

3

4 He said that one of the elders used to ask to go  
5 along with him when he got caribou hunting in 17(B) area, but  
6 he used to be afraid to travel in that distance. For this  
7 reasons I am supporting this proposal.

8

9 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any more discussion?  
10 Bill.

11

12 MR. McCANN: I'll make a motion to accept  
13 this proposal.

14

15 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Support?

16

17 MR. McCANN: Support.

18

19 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion on the  
20 floor to support Proposal 37, is there any second to the  
21 motion?

22

23 MR. HANSON: Second.

24

25 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Second by John Hanson.  
26 Discussion?

27

28 (No audible responses)

29

30 MR. THOMPSON: Question.

31

32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question has been called  
33 for. Roll call.

34

35 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

36

37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

38

39 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion Nicolai.

40

41 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

42

43 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

44

45 MR. McCANN: Yes.

46

47 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

48

49 (No response)

50

00104

1 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

2  
3 MR. HANSON: Yes.

4  
5 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

6  
7 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

8  
9 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

10  
11 (No response)

12  
13 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

14  
15 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

16  
17 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

18  
19 (No response)

20  
21 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

22  
23 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

24  
25 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson, Sr.

26  
27 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

28  
29 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yes, three  
30 excused.

31  
32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: 37 is supported by the  
33 Council. Next Proposal is 99-38, revised C&T for caribou in  
34 17(A) for residents of Eek and Quinhagak. Pat.

35  
36 MS. McCLENAHAN: Yes, Mr. Chairman, that was  
37 covered under Proposal 37 and when you voted to support  
38 Proposal 37, you also, I believe, voted to support the Eek  
39 and Quinhagak. Actually, sir, Proposal 38 says for all of  
40 Unit 17 and so the staff recommendation would be support it  
41 for Eek and Quinhagak for Unit 17(A) and that specific  
42 portion of Unit 17(B) that is documented as having been used  
43 by Eek and Quinhagak, so you may want to take a separate vote  
44 on that.

45  
46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: So we take it separate  
47 instead of include it with 37? 38 separate?

48  
49 MS. McCLENAHAN: Because it also mentions the  
50 rest of Unit 17 it might be a good idea to do that.



00105

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, okay.

2

3 Department of Fish and Game comments on Proposal 37.

4

5 MR. J. ANDREW: 38.

6

7 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: I mean 38.

8

9 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, members of the  
10 Council, thank you. Mike Coffing, Fish and Game Subsistence.  
11 The State's comments on 38 are exactly the same comments that  
12 we gave for Proposal 37, okay.

13  
14 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you.

15  
16 MR. COFFING: Thank you.

17  
18 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: AVCP, Tim.

19  
20 MR. T. ANDREW: Mr. Chairman, our position is  
21 basically the same as 37.

22  
23 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Tim. Kuigpagmiut.

24  
25 MR. REEVES: Thank you. Same as 37.

26  
27 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you. Is there any  
28 public testimony to Proposal 38, Andrew?

29  
30 MR. J. ANDREW: (In Yup'ik)

31  
32 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Any public testimony  
33 towards 38?

34  
35 (No audible responses)

36  
37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If none, Regional Council  
38 recommendation, justification to Proposal 38.

39  
40 MR. HANSON: Mr. Chair.

41  
42 MR. CHURCH: I make a motion to adopt  
43 Proposal 38.

44  
45 MR. CHARLES: Second.

46  
47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion on the  
48 floor of Willard to accept 38, second by.....

49  
50 MR. CHARLES: Me.

00106

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: .....Charles.

2 Discussion?

3  
4 MR. L. WILDE: Question.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question been called for.

7 Roll call.  
8 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

9  
10 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

11  
12 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion Nicolai.

13  
14 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

15  
16 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

17  
18 MR. McCANN: Yes.

19  
20 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

21  
22 (No response)

23  
24 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

25  
26 MR. HANSON: Yes.

27  
28 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

29  
30 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

31  
32 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

33  
34 (No response)

35  
36 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

37  
38 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

39  
40 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

41  
42 (No response)

43  
44 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

45  
46 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

47  
48 MR. GEORGE: Johnny Thompson, Sr.

49  
50 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

00107

1 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yes, three  
2 excused.

3  
4 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Council recommend support  
5 this proposal.

6  
7 Next proposal and last, 99-40, request establishing a  
8 season for moose in 17(A). (Deferred Proposal 98-59)  
9 Submitted by Togiak National Wildlife Refuge.

10  
11 MR. KOVACH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. As you  
12 just mentioned this is a proposal that's been carried over  
13 from last year. The Federal Subsistence Board at the  
14 recommendation of the Bristol Bay Council tabled the proposal  
15 until some additional information could be obtained.

16  
17 This proposal actually stems from a real success  
18 story, just 10 years ago there were no moose in Unit 17(A)  
19 and now there are sufficient numbers of moose to start -- to  
20 begin to have some limited hunts.

21  
22 This proposal was submitted by the Togiak National  
23 Wildlife Refuge a year ago. It would establish a moose  
24 hunting season in 17(A), harvest limit would be one bull by  
25 State registration permit, with a season of August 20th  
26 through September 15th. Moose season would be closed with  
27 the harvest limit within the entire subunit has been reached.  
28 The harvest limit would be determined on an annual basis, as  
29 per the Management Plan.

30  
31 Current customary and traditional use determination  
32 for moose in 17(A) includes all residents of Unit 17, plus  
33 residents of Goodnews Bay, Platinum, Kwethluk. And under  
34 State and Federal regulations there was no moose season in  
35 this area from 1981 till 1997, in fact, due to the lack of  
36 moose in the area. Prior to 1981 the State season was  
37 September 10 through 20 season, as well as December 10  
38 through 31 season, with a harvest limit of one bull moose.

39  
40 There's been quite a history in this area with  
41 regards to trying to get a moose hunt reestablished, it's  
42 kind of laid out in more detail in the draft staff analysis.  
43 Basically the Board of Game passed a limited bull moose  
44 season by registration permit. A Special Action Request was  
45 submitted to the Federal Subsistence Board later in 1997 and  
46 they created a parallel season, same dates, same restrictions  
47 on permits and season dates.

48  
49 The Special Action was only good for one year and for  
50 the 1998-99 season, the only moose season for Unit 17(A) was

00108

1 under the State regulations. This proposal has now come  
2 back. The primary reason why it was deferred by the Bristol  
3 Bay Council wished the Togiak Refuge and the Alaska  
4 Department of Fish and Game more time to develop their  
5 management plan. That plan is almost complete, Togiak Refuge  
6 and Fish and Game are currently in the process of doing  
7 another census of moose in the area. They expect to find in  
8 well of excess of 600 moose in the area. A fairly  
9 significant thing, consider just in 1990 they couldn't find a  
10 single moose in the whole area.

11  
12 The management plan is almost complete, it's not  
13 there yet, so I cannot give you any kind of an idea of what  
14 the recommendations are going to be for harvest limits. But  
15 because the total management plan is expected out the end of  
16 this month, is their schedule, and it will contain  
17 recommendations for hunting. The Togiak Refuge requested  
18 that this proposal be put back into active consideration by  
19 the affected Regional Councils and the Federal Subsistence  
20 Board.

21  
22 The preliminary conclusions from the staff is to  
23 support this proposal and the recommendations contained with  
24 in the management plan itself as this would establish a  
25 permanent harvest for moose for residents in the area which  
26 has not been available for a number of years.

27  
28 The management plan is going to be conservative, Mr.  
29 Chair, because moose will travel through Unit 17(A) and enter  
30 into 18, providing some additional hunting opportunities for  
31 residents of Platinum and Quinhagak and Goodnews Bay in their  
32 local areas and where they won't have to travel near as far  
33 as this population continues to grow.

34  
35 That's all I have, Mr. Chair.

36  
37 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, thank you.  
38 Department of Fish and Game.

39  
40 MR. COFFING: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,  
41 Michael Coffing, Fish and Game Subsistence. The State  
42 supports this proposal. The office there in Dillingham works  
43 closely with the Togiak National Wildlife Refuge in  
44 management efforts for this area for moose. And also the  
45 seasons that are being proposed in this proposal are exactly  
46 the same season that the State currently has, so we'll have  
47 the same opening and closing dates on both State and Federal  
48 lands over there.

49  
50 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

00109

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Mike. Pete  
2 (In Yup'ik)

3  
4 INTERPRETER NICK: Pete Abraham.

5  
6 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Yup'ik)

7  
8 INTERPRETER NICK: Pete Abraham from Togiak  
9 National Wildlife Refuge stated that he supports this  
10 proposal because he worked on it for so long. He said that  
11 in 17(A) there's a lot of moose available for harvest. He  
12 said that they will also discuss this proposal during the  
13 March 23-24 meeting and he expresses support for the  
14 proposal.

15  
16 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Pete. AVCP,  
17 Tim.

18  
19 MR. T. ANDREW: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
20 AVCP stands in support of this as it would create more  
21 subsistence opportunities.

22  
23 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Tim. Jeff  
24 Reeves, Kuigpagmiut.

25  
26 MR. REEVES: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
27 Kuigpagmiut would support this as it is benefiting Native --  
28 other Native peoples and since it does not directly affect  
29 us. Also, on a personal note, I'd like to see the Board  
30 support this, as I do have direct family in that area that  
31 would be affected by this.

32  
33 Thank you.

34  
35 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Thank you, Jeff.

36  
37 Is there any other written public comment, Andrew?

38  
39 MR. J. ANDREW: (In Yup'ik)

40  
41 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Do we have public  
42 testimony at this time?

43  
44 (No audible responses)

45  
46 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: If it's not, Regional  
47 Council deliberations and recommendations, justifications.

48  
49 John.

50

00110

1 MR. HANSON: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
2 Well, Mike, you better go sit over here again. We're picking  
3 on you because you're State.

4  
5 (Laughter)

6  
7 MR. COFFING: I don't get out here too often  
8 so take a shot at me.

9  
10 MR. HANSON: I want to ask -- okay, on when  
11 they open the season, how many moose is killed from this area  
12 with a population of about 600?

13  
14 MR. COFFING: Let me get my reference  
15 material and I can answer that for the last two years anyway.

16  
17 MR. HANSON: Okay.

18  
19 MR. ABRAHAM: Mike.

20  
21 MR. COFFING: Mr. Chairman, and members of  
22 the Council, I'm looking and referring to -- actually, let me  
23 clarify. Are you asking about 17(A) in this proposal  
24 specifically, not.....

25  
26 MR. HANSON: What I mean is when they open  
27 the season on moose for that area, how many moose are taken?

28  
29 MR. COFFING: That information is actually  
30 contained on page 102 of the analysis at the bottom of the  
31 page. Now, under the State season -- in 1997, the season was  
32 August 20 to September 15, the bag limit was one bull. A  
33 total of 44 permits were issued, 15 moose were harvested.  
34 Now in 1998, the most recent fall season, the State issued 48  
35 permits, four more permits than the year before, and the  
36 harvest was 10 moose reported. So we had more permits issued  
37 the second year but we had fewer moose reported harvested  
38 under the permit system, most recent year.

39  
40 MR. HANSON: Okay. This area, is this a  
41 permit hunt?

42  
43 MR. COFFING: That's correct.

44  
45 MR. HANSON: It's a drawing permit or first  
46 come, first serve?

47  
48 MR. COFFING: I'm not sure the mechanics of  
49 it, perhaps Pete knows more about that.

50

00111

1 MR. ABRAHAM: I'll answer that question.  
2 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. John (In Yup'ik)

3  
4 INTERPRETER NICK: Pete Abraham explained  
5 that the permit drawing system is that, you know, there's no  
6 limit for the community in that unit. But then there's  
7 restrictions for sport hunters who want to apply for a permit  
8 in that respective area. That area, in comparison to any  
9 drainages in this area, is very much different than what you  
10 find here in this Y-K Delta area. The drainage are very,  
11 very narrow and very shallow. For that reason when they  
12 first opened a permit hunt for moose, they harvested only 15  
13 moose. But then the moose are increasing in that area and  
14 maybe some day it will be open for the State resident hunt.

15  
16 MR. HANSON: (In Yup'ik)

17  
18 INTERPRETER NICK: My clarification is that  
19 Pete explained earlier that there are no State openings for  
20 moose in that area, only a permit hunt for local residents.

21  
22 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Yup'ik)

23  
24 INTERPRETER NICK: John Hanson said that it  
25 was open for sport hunters also, but Pete explained to him  
26 that it's only for the residents of Unit 17.

27  
28 MR. ABRAHAM: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

29  
30 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yeah, quyana.

31  
32 MR. HANSON: Thank you, Mike.

33  
34 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Quyana, Mike. Any more  
35 discussion, Council?

36  
37 (No audible responses)

38  
39 MR. THOMPSON: I'll make a motion to support  
40 that.

41  
42 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: There's a motion on the  
43 floor to support.

44  
45 MR. L. WILDE: I'll second it.

46  
47 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Proposal 40 second by  
48 Lester Wilde. Discussion.

49  
50 MR. HANSON: Question.

00112

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Question been called for.  
2 Roll call.

3  
4 MR. GEORGE: Harry Wilde.

5  
6 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Yes.

7  
8 MR. GEORGE: Ilarion Nicolai.

9  
10 MR. NICOLAI: Yes.

11  
12 MR. GEORGE: Billy McCann.

13  
14 MR. McCANN: Yes.

15  
16 MR. GEORGE: Paul John.

17  
18 (No response)

19  
20 MR. GEORGE: John Hanson.

21  
22 MR. HANSON: Yes.

23  
24 MR. GEORGE: James Charles.

25  
26 MR. CHARLES: Yes.

27  
28 MR. GEORGE: (In Yup'ik) Robert Nick.

29  
30 (No response)

31  
32 MR. GEORGE: Lester Wilde.

33  
34 MR. L. WILDE: Yes.

35  
36 MR. GEORGE: Paul Manumik.

37  
38 (No response)

39  
40 MR. GEORGE: Willard Church.

41  
42 MR. CHURCH: Yes.

43  
44 MR. GEORGE: John Thompson.

45  
46 MR. THOMPSON: Yes.

47  
48 MR. GEORGE: Mr. Chairman, nine yes, three  
49 excused.

50



00113

1 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: Proposal 40 is supported  
2 by Regional Council.

3  
4 We're going to recess now till tomorrow morning. We  
5 got one more proposal that have to be teleconferenced with  
6 tomorrow by 10:00 and we will start out agencies report  
7 tomorrow and at 10:00 o'clock we'll go back to that Proposal  
8 42.

9  
10 So we're in recess till tomorrow morning.

11  
12 MR. J. ANDREW: What time are you going to go  
13 to?

14  
15 CHAIRMAN H. WILDE: 8:00 o'clock. Start 8:00  
16 o'clock in the morning. Thank you, Pat.

17  
18 MS. McCLENAHAN: Your welcome, Mr. Chairman.

19  
20 (Off record)

21  
22 (MEETING RECESSED)

00114

C E R T I F I C A T E

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA )  
 ) ss.  
STATE OF ALASKA )

I, Joseph P. Kolasinski, Notary Public in and for the  
State of Alaska and Owner of Computer Matrix, do hereby  
certify:

THAT the foregoing pages numbered 02 through 113  
contain a full, true and correct Transcript of VOLUME I,  
YUKON-KUSKOKWIM DELTA FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL COUNCIL  
PUBLIC MEETING, taken electronically by myself on the 2nd day  
of March, 1999, beginning at the hour of 8:33 o'clock a.m. at  
the Alakanuk City Hall, Alakanuk, Alaska;

THAT the transcript is a true and correct transcript  
requested to be transcribed and thereafter transcribed by  
under my direction to the best of my knowledge and ability;

THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party  
interested in any way in this action.

DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 12th day of March,  
1999.

---

Joseph P. Kolasinski  
Notary Public in and for Alaska  
My Commission Expires: 4/17/00